

FINAL REPORT

TECHNICAL RESOURCES-II PROJECT (#388-0074)

MID-TERM EVALUATION

Prepared for:

USAID Mission/Dhaka

Submitted by:

Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.
1730 Rhode Island Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20009
U.S.A.

September 1994

**Prepared for
USAID MISSION/DHAKA**

**TECHNICAL RESOURCES-II PROJECT
(# 388-0074)**

MID-TERM EVALUATION

**Draft Final Report
August 94**

Checchi & Company Consulting Inc.
Washington D.C, USA.

ACRONYMS

ACAD	Advanced Course in Administration and Development
ADP	Annual Development Plan
APD	Academy of Planning and Development
BCS	Bangladesh Civil Service
BDG	Bangladesh Government
BIAM	Bangladesh Institute of Administration and Management
BIDS	Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies
BPATC	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center
BFPP	Bangladesh Food Policy Project
CSP	Civil Service of Pakistan
DMT	Development Management Training
DSE	Dhaka Stock Exchange
EPCS	East Pakistan Civil Service
ERD	External Resources Division
FPMU	Food Policy Monitoring Unit
HRD	Human Resource Development
IBA	Institute of Business Administration
IDA	International Development Association
IPSA	Institute of Post Graduate Studies in Agriculture
MIS	Management Information System
MOE	Ministry of Establishment
OJT	On-the-Job Training
PAES	Public Administration Efficiency Study
PCP	Project Concept Paper
PIL	Project Implementation Letter
SSC	Senior Staff Course
TA	Technical Assistance
TAPP	Technical Assistance Project Proforma
TRP	Technical Resources Project
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WID	Women in Development

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
A. Overall Assessment	i
! Project Benefits	i
! Flexibility	i
! Focus	ii
! Usefulness	iii
! ERD Capacity Building	iii
! Future Planning	iv
B. Other Key Findings and Recommendations	iv
CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION	
A. Background	1
B. Present Context	2
C. Purpose and Objectives of Evaluation	3
D. Evaluation Methods	4
CHAPTER II FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS - TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	
A. Overall Assessment	5
B. Impact on USAID and BDG Priorities	6
C. Specific Problems	8
! Project Design and Approval	8
CHAPTER III FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS - TRAINING	
A. Overseas Skill Development Training under TRP-II	9
! Criteria	9
! Nomination and Selection Procedures	9
! Participants' Survey	10
- General Benefits	10
- Job relevance	10
- Utilization	12

-	Constraints to Utilization	12
-	General Findings	12

CHAPTER III FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS - TRAINING

(Contd...)

B.	Obstacles to TRP-II Funded Training	13
!	Training Needs Assessment	13
!	Institutional Deficiencies	14
!	Dis-incentives	15
!	WID-Related Training	16

CHAPTER IV Future Planning

A.	Public Administration as a Context	17
B.	Decline in BDG's Efficiency	17
C.	TRP-II and its Re-orientation Needs	18
D.	Proposed Planning Activities (Existing and Future)	20
!	DMT Component	20
!	Support for Institutional Development of BIAM	20
!	Support for WID-Related Training and Institutional Development	21
!	ERD Capacity Building	22
!	Sustainability-Support Activities	22

ANNEXURES : 1 - 10

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Mid-term Evaluation of the Technical Resource II Project (TRP-II) has been carried out, for the USAID Mission Dhaka, by a Team of consultants under a contract with Checchi & Company Consulting Inc. The Team comprised of Rashid Ahmad, Team Leader, Nasser Ahmad, Institutional Development Specialist, and Abu Yussuf Abdullah, Research Associate. The Evaluation was carried out during June 15 - July 18, 1994.

The Evaluation Team would like to thank the Mission Officials, in particular the Mission Director Mr. Richard Brown, the Deputy Mission Director Mr. Frank Young, the Program Officer Mr. Karl Swartz, the Evaluation Officer Ms. Jan Rockliffe-King, and the Project Officer Syed Al-Muti for their cooperation and assistance. A satisfactory completion of the Evaluation within the limited time would have been difficult without the frequent advice and directions provided by Ms. Rockliffe-King and Syed Al-Muti at each stage of the work. The Team would like to express its gratitude for the assistance provided by the two officials.

A number of high-ranking officials in the Government of Bangladesh provided the Team with their candid views on the present development policies and procedures and their implications for the future TRP-II operations. The Team owes special thanks to Mr. Asfa-ud-Dowlah, Member Planning Commission, Mr. Sadat Hossain, Additional Secretary, ERD (America Desk), Mr. Muhammad Ismail Hossain, Additional Secretary Establishment, and Mr. Badiur Rehman, Commissioner Dhaka. Mr. Sadat Hossain extended full cooperation on the part of ERD and personally took a keen interest in the Evaluation. In addition, Mr. Iqbal Chowdhary, Deputy Secretary and Mr. Shahid Ullah, Sr. Assistant Secretary of ERD (America Branch) made themselves available for extended discussions on the Project and the Team would like to thank them.

The Team is equally thankful to other officials in the USAID Mission, the World Bank, UNDP, and BDG ministries and departments for taking the time to discuss related issues and provide their views.

TRP-II supported activities have contributed to the policy reforms and institutional development in key sectors of the Government. The Evaluation has highlighted both the past achievements and the present limitations of the Project and emphasized the importance of consensus building between USAID and ERD in order to continue to utilize TRP-II resources in support of mutually agreed priorities. The Team hopes that the Evaluation Report helps to stimulate discussion and actions.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

A. Overall Assessment

Project Benefits

1.1 The Technical Resources Project (TRP-II) supported technical assistance activities have produced both direct and indirect benefits to the Bangladesh Government's (BDG's) policy reform program as well as enhanced the Mission's portfolio. BDG's food policy reforms, supported by the Bangladesh Food Policy Project (BFPP) including the institutional development of Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) have been mutually beneficial and responsive both to the priorities of BDG and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). For the USAID, TRP-II sub-projects namely BFPP, Institute of Post Graduate Studies in Agriculture (IPSA), and Human Resource Development in Agriculture (HRD/Winrock) have helped to produce cumulative and synergistic effects on food and agriculture program of the Mission's portfolio. Parallel financing under TRP-II has complemented the inputs of other donors by providing technical assistance for capacity building in food and agriculture sectors and improved inter-donor coordination.

1.2 In sum, technical assistance provided under TRP-II has supported capacity building in BDG in the forms of:

- (a) Policy reforms and institution building in mutual BDG and USAID priority areas.
- (b) Introduction of modern Management Information Systems (MIS) and analytical methods in BDG institutions.
- (c) Improvements in policy analysis and research capacity in agriculture and food sectors in BDG institutions.
- (d) Transfer of modern skills through training.

The above capacity building measures have been achieved in terms of operational outputs of the sub-projects. This Evaluation, on the basis of the review of the sub-projects, however, indicates that some of the gains have been insufficient to provide sustainable operations due to frequent rotations and loss of trained personnel in the client institutions as well as due to insufficient progress on required policy reforms on the part of BDG. We recommend that TRP-II criteria and its activities should explicitly take into account sustainability considerations in project design and monitoring.

Flexibility

1.3 TRP-II has a certain degree of in-built procedural flexibility on account of its umbrella financing status. However, the TRP II sub-activities are "supposed" to be equally controlled by the standard operating procedures, of both the USAID and BDG, with regards to all facets of project cycle.

1.4 Procedural flexibility of TRP-II should be viewed both in unilateral and bilateral terms. Bilaterally, flexibility connotes two parties adopting "relaxed, quick but consistent procedures" in design and approval of activities to support mutually shared objectives. Our Evaluation of TRP-II's past procedures and practices do not provide evidence in support of bilateral flexibility. The Evaluation indicates that USAID was able to exert unilateral flexibility in utilization of TRP-II resources in the past to support a range of Technical Assistance (TA). And, this was made possible partly by the past "liberal" environment and decentralized practices within BDG ministries with respect to project approval. It should be mentioned that the past "liberal" environment in BDG has been replaced by the present centralized and uniform procedures for approval of all development projects.

1.5 In our view, a "democratization" of flexibility is needed. We believe that flexibility is basically bilateral. It is primarily characterized by interaction and negotiation between two parties. In this regard, we consider the present consultative arrangements and coordination between USAID and External Resource Division (ERD) as promising. We recommend that this consultative process should be strengthened by: a) strengthening ERD capacity and information management resources; and b) by USAID's and ERD's mutual adoption of a collaborative approach, with the involvement of concerned users and beneficiary institutions, to plan a series of activities.

Focus

1.6 According to this Evaluation, the focus of the TRP-II sub-activities in technical assistance and training do not appear to be a function of deliberately planned priorities. Four of the nine sub-projects namely IPSA, BFPP, FMPU, HRD/Winrock funded by TRP-II are essentially carry-overs from TRP-I; and three of the sub-projects namely IPSA, Flood Action Plan (FAP), Export Development, parallel financed by TRP-II, are in support of initiatives by other donors. Of the remaining two, Dhaka Stock Exchange (DSE) is a unilateral obligation, and the Public Administration Efficiency Study (PAES), a BDG initiative, the recommendations of which remain to be implemented by the Government. This suggests a lack of a framework for selection and prioritization. It further suggests that TRP-II activities have been largely supply-driven and that the TRP-II resources appear to search for "fundable" activities, rather than the opposite.

1.7 According to this Evaluation, selection of TA sub-projects has been a bit ad-hoc and too diffused which makes it difficult to consolidate the gains of TRP-II investments in improving BDG's technical and managerial capacities. The overall objective of TRP-II being the improvement of BDG's technical and managerial capacity requires technical assistance in support of development of core competencies, quality manpower, and better management practices. Technical assistance directed at discreet sectors under TRP-II is insufficient to build the overall capacity in the Government. Hence, there is a need to sharpen the focus of TRP-II within a coherent framework. We recommend that the Project should adopt public administration as an overall framework for its future operations. In addition, collaborative planning should be undertaken within the following proposed parameters: i) integrated planning of technical assistance and training activities directed to capacity building in BDG; ii) support to build qualitative aspects of training;

iii) sustainability considerations in determining future operations; and iv) mutually agreed procedures for defining priorities.

Usefulness

1.8 An umbrella financing mechanism, like TRP-II, has an "intrinsic" utility in terms of pre-arranged availability of funds that could be quickly accessed to support priority activities. On the other hand, a major drawback of this mechanism is that it provides "less competitive" money which is vulnerable to unplanned and random utilization.

1.9 The usefulness of TRP-II, in specific, should be viewed in relation to the added value that TRP-II money has provided to selected high priority activities. This Evaluation indicates that such added value is evident, to a great extent, from the technical outputs and benefits of the sub-projects. However, procedural liberties taken both on USAID and BDG sides in the past with respect to the lack of mutual consent, lack of prioritization procedures, diverse focus of selection, and leniencies in project monitoring and closure are indicative of hidden costs. In our view, a transparent system to determine mutually agreed priorities combined with improved project design, implementation, monitoring and closure procedures are pre-requisites for a better utilization of TRP-II resources, both in financial and institutional terms.

ERD Capacity Building

1.10 ERD, as the implementing agency for TRP-II has substantially improved its coordination and consultative functions both with respect to USAID and BDG line ministries. The improvements have occurred as a result of the present strong leadership and competent staff. The working relationship between ERD and USAID in deciding upon TRP-II related matters is considered satisfactory by both parties.

1.11 The staff resources relative to the amount of work in ERD are limited. Both ERD and USAID could certainly benefit from additional staff, preferably with technical qualifications and experience in project design and approval. We recommend that ERD and USAID should discuss the issue of understaffing and take corrective actions. In our view, it seems feasible to provide additional technical personnel to ERD, on contractual basis, to be supported from the Project funds.

1.12 Present and future planning of TRP-II is going to be undertaken within "bounded flexibility" resulting from the uniformity of BDG guidelines for TA design and approval and the present BDG policy to selectively utilize foreign TA. The future planning is expected to be more demand-driven than supply-driven, in contrast to the past. However, the institutional capacity in BDG and specifically in ERD to create this "presumed" demand is limited.

1.13 The coordinating functions in ERD require quick access and retrieval of information thus pointing the need for a proper MIS. At present, ERD finds it difficult to maintain easily accessible record of TA and

training activities completed and under plan which are supported by TRP-II. We recommend that ERD should consider strengthening its MIS by specifically establishing a properly equipped and manned network system with custom-designed software which can be operated by ERD officers with little effort. This would enable ERD to play a pro-active role in future planning and decision-making with respect to TRP-II type activities.

Future Planning

1.14 The change in BDG's orientation to selectively utilize foreign technical assistance is likely to decrease the demand for technical assistance and increase the demand for training. In the context of TRP-II, this is likely to happen due to stringent technical requirements related to planning and implementing technical assistance activities as compared to what is required for implementing insufficiently planned and ad-hoc training programs.

1.15 Regardless of the merits and de-merits of the BDG guidelines, we suggest that ERD take required initiatives to utilize TRP-II resources in a demand-driven manner. For future planning of TRP-II activities, we recommend that once USAID and ERD agree upon an initial project concept that USAID could directly assist the concerned client institutions in design of the project and preparation of TAPP. Furthermore, ERD should ensure an expeditious approval of the planned activities.

1.16 TRP-II is well suited for supporting programs and activities in response to "critical" capacity gaps in public administration. Also, the Development Management Training (DMT) component could have positive bearing on administrative efficiency, if properly planned and executed. We have described, in Chapter IV, some of the constraints in the planning of the DMT component and have offered our suggestions. We also recommend a number of prospective activities, both present and future, for consideration of USAID and BDG in Chapter IV.

1.17 The proposed activities, in our view, are consistent with the past focus as well as with our recommended parameters for TRP-II future operations. Proper planning of these activities will require support of both the USAID and ERD and a collaborative and participatory planning approach with involvement of intended beneficiary institutions in planning and executing future TRP-II activities. An action plan to help design the proposed activities is attached as Annexure 7.

B. Other Key Findings and Recommendations

1.18 The Evaluation has also examined the effects of TRP-II funded activities on the management of Mission's regular portfolio. The effects of TRP-II on the Mission's portfolio can be summarized as:

- (a) The TRP-II sub-projects were instrumental in producing synergistic effects, especially in agriculture and food sectors.
- (b) TRP-II enhanced sustainability of USAID's investments.
- (c) TRP-II supported other donor initiatives and helped improve inter-donor coordination.
- (d) TRP-II increased labor-intensity in project management on the part of Mission's technical offices.
- (e) TRP-II utilized "less competitive" money for certain low impact activities, especially in training.
- (f) TRP-II adversely affected standard project monitoring and procurement procedures.
- (g) TRP-II created significant problems in project closures.

1.19 BDG has prepared detailed guidelines on preparation and approval procedures of TAPP. These guidelines, in our view, are comprehensive and provide valuable directions for preparing quality TAPPs. Various elements of the guidelines include, among others, strategies for human resource development, implementation and follow-up of training, and modalities for successful transfer of technology, etc. However, the guidelines are not followed mainly for lack of adequate skills, training, and motivation of BDG personnel responsible for preparation of TAPPs. Furthermore, there is no management process and accountability to ensure application of the planning guidelines. We suggest that USAID in consultation with ERD should explore the possibility of creating an on-the-job training program to train personnel in the planning cells of core ministries.

1.20 TRP-II, as a Project, has contributed toward policy reforms and institutional development in several sectors, and especially in agriculture and food sectors. TRP-II has also served as a catalyst for institution building and human resource development in agriculture sector, as in the case of IPISA and FPMU. These achievements conform well with the overall objectives of the Project. However, sustainability of policy reforms undertaken by the Government remains at stake without institutional reforms and qualitative development in public administration. Sustainability is also necessary to protect USAID's investments and to consolidate emergent gains. We recommend that TRP-II could sharpen the focus of its inputs by re-orienting its resources within the framework of public administration. This proposed reorientation is consistent with current priorities of BDG, USAID, and other donors aimed at improving administrative performance.

1.21 With respect to short-term overseas training, objectivity and transparency of nomination and selection procedures is difficult to maintain in the absence of training plans based on needs. Based on our interview with the participants and others, we also understand that the training offers are not widely circulated and more availed by BCS (admin) cadre in comparison to other cadres. We recommend that ERD should consider establishing a standing committee comprising of representatives of concerned ministries and outside experts for selection of participants under a uniform criteria that includes merit as a primary consideration. Further, we recommend that ERD should ensure wider and timely circulation of training offers.

1.22 The findings from the Participants' Survey, though tentative, suggest a lack of clear benefits of overseas training in terms of skill development in BDG. We recommend that USAID and ERD should take appropriate measures to improve selection methods and design of training programs. Further, we recommend that USAID should consider utilization of regional training institutions to the maximum possible and in appropriate areas which will help to reduce cost, and improve relevance of training, on account of similarities in learning environments among regional countries. Use of regional training institutions will also help to develop linkages between BPATC and other institutions and facilitate frequent exchange of faculty and other resources at affordable costs.

1.23 In absence of actual needs assessment, the linkage between in-country and overseas training is not explicit and not reflected in the selection procedures for overseas training. In the specific context of TRP-II, the present linkage of in-country and overseas training is weak. In-country training component at BPATC appears to be sufficiently focused. The overseas training component requires improved focus and quick placements to provide better linkage and optimize the benefits of overseas training. ERD, as the implementing agency of the project needs to perform an active role in ensuring appropriate linkage between in-country and TRP-II funded overseas training. At the same time, USAID should assist BPATC in improving the focus of overseas training component in order to better plan and link in-country and overseas training vis-a-vis ACAD and SSC programs. Short-term overseas training should be planned in a manner that it could take place soon after completion of in-country training.

1.24 BPATC and other public sector training institutions suffer from inherent structural and institutional problems including government control, academic orientation, poor quality of faculty, weak programming, and limited monetary and non-monetary incentives. These inherent problems limit the scope of training institutions in public sector in developing into good quality, service-oriented, and economically viable organizations. Therefore, there is a clear need for supporting public or private initiatives in institution building and training which incorporate autonomy, self-financing, and broad based clientele. In this regard a recent initiative taken by the BCS (Admin) Welfare Association in establishing the Bangladesh Institute of Administration and Management (BIAM) deserves serious consideration by USAID. We recommend that USAID enter into a dialogue with BIAM toward defining a program which could be supported by TRP-II resources.

1.25 The DMT sub-component activities are discretely formulated with no specified links between and among them. TRP-II as a project and the DMT as its component are aimed at improving managerial and technical capacity in the Government and to help build training capacity of local institutions. The integration of DMT sub-component activities within an institutional development framework is necessary. We recommend that ERD should take necessary initiative to determine respective roles and responsibilities of ERD, MOE, BPATC and other recipient institutions of DMT funding and provide the needed coordination and approval for an early implementation of the DMT component, as an integrated plan.

1.26 BPATC, being the main beneficiary of DMT components, should develop an integrated plan for DMT inputs, for both in-country and overseas training. Involvement of BMDC, APD, IBA, and other training institutions will be necessary in this process. BPATC should also develop an annual implementation plan based on the integrated plan as suggested or convert the integrated plan into a 3 year sub-project.

1.27 ERD, in consultation with the USAID, should review the annual plan/sub-project, as the case may be. Upon a satisfactory review of the annual plan/sub-project, we recommend that approval should be given by ERD by signing a Project Implementation Letter (PIL). BPATC should be designated as the implementing institutions under the PIL agreement.

1.28 The participant survey and interviews conducted suggest that females display relatively higher motivation and take an active interest in applying acquired skills and hence female candidates deserve special attention. In our view, active targeting of female officers in BDG through non-governmental and independent means may help to increase utilization of the Women in Development (WID) component in TRP-II.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

A. Background

1.1 The Technical Resources II Project (TRP-II) is a follow-on to TRP-I which was designed as an umbrella financing mechanism to support technical assistance and training in response to priorities of both the USAID Mission and Bangladesh Government (BDG). TRP-II was authorized in 1988 at a funding level of \$19 million and a project completion date of July 1996. Later, USAID and BDG mutually agreed to increase the funding level to \$30 million and extend the project completion date to August 1998.

1.2 The overall goal of TRP-II is to assist BDG in improving its performance in social and economic development in areas related to the Mission's strategic framework. The basic purpose is to improve managerial and technical capacity in BDG to effectively design and implement development programs.

1.3 The project specified broad categories of technical assistance, studies, and training in priority areas of USAID and BDG which would qualify for TRP-II funding. The project design also made provision for parallel financing of activities with other donors. In addition to outlining of the broad categories, the TRP-II Project Paper set forth the following specific criteria for supporting the sub-activities under the umbrella mechanism:

- (a) Proposed sub-projects must be consistent with BDG and USAID development priorities.
- (b) Proposed sub-projects must be completed within 36 months and the planned budget for any one sub-project can not exceed \$3 million, unless USAID and the BDG agree in writing.
- (c) For other than proposed training activities, sub-projects must have BDG clearance in the form of an approved Project Concept Paper (PCP) or an approved Technical Assistance Project Proforma (TAPP).

1.4 Procedurally, TRP-II funded sub-projects differ from the projects in the Mission's portfolio in terms of less stringent requirements in design and approval. The USAID's requirements for stand-alone projects are more stringent with respect to project identification, design, and approval and in which USAID/Washington has a direct involvement. The Mission's Manual Order for TRP-II specifies a streamlined process of sub-project approval according to the size of funding and the approval authority remains within the Mission. However, similar USAID procurement procedures are followed in TRP-II as in other projects. Thus the difference between TRP-II funded sub-projects and the portfolio projects is largely a function of the umbrella financing available to TRP-II.

B. Present Context

1.5 The original intent, on part of the USAID, in designing the Project was to create a flexible and quick response mechanism for supporting high priority activities not covered by its regular portfolio. In addition, it was intended to fund relatively short-term policy-oriented technical assistance and specialized training not anticipated in other projects.

1.6 Four of the sub-projects under TRP-I were carried over to TRP-II and have been recently completed. These include: BFP, IPSA, HRD/Winrock and FPMU. A complete list of the sub-projects funded by TRP-II is provided as a project digest in Annexure 1. Presently, there are no formally approved new sub-projects in the TRP-II portfolio. The Mission and BDG are considering co-financing of the UNDP sponsored Disaster Management Project.

1.7 Since the inception of TRP-II in 1988, BDG has reviewed its policies and procedures regarding foreign technical assistance. The changes in BDG's procedures for utilization of foreign technical assistance have a direct bearing upon TRP-II future activities. The BDG has specified the general guidelines which prescribe, among others, "that efforts for securing foreign assistance will be made only for those projects which are formally approved and accepted by the government." This apparently stems from BDG concerns to streamline project design and approval processes and to bring discipline and transparency to its development portfolio and budgetary system. The USAID Mission has also refined its strategic priorities as reflected in the Mission's Strategic Statement. At present, the Mission's objectives are to: reduce fertility and improve maternal and child health; increase employment, productivity, and competition in agriculture, finance, and industry; increase the capacity of poor to participate in and benefit from a productive economy; and increase accountability of democratic institutions. The changes in BDG's procedures for TA utilization and the USAID's current priorities and objectives point toward a need for closer consultation and building consensus for future design of activities to be supported under TRP-II.

1.8 The External Resources Division (ERD, America Desk) has developed, in consultation with USAID, specific guidelines for utilization of TRP-II resources. The guidelines, formulated in July 1993, are:

- (a) Projects should conform to standard TAPP procedures and the guidelines established by BDG.
- (b) Initiatives to be funded by TRP-II could be taken from either parties and discussed to arrive at a consensus.
- (c) Training proposals from ministries and USAID have to be justified in terms of their visible contribution to institutional development.
- (d) Projects should be designed on the basis of actual needs by the BDG itself and should be consistent with its policies.
- (e) Accountability and transparency in project selection and approval must be emphasized.

- (f) Close and regular consultation should be pursued by the two parties in approving technical assistance and training activities under TRP-II.

C. Purpose and Objectives of Evaluation

1.9 This Evaluation is mainly a Mid-term Process Evaluation. The overall purpose of the Evaluation is to assist the Mission and BDG in assessing the utility of TRP-II as a flexible umbrella financing mechanism in order to provide technical assistance and training in support of mutually defined priorities.

1.10 The two main foci of the Evaluation are: i) an assessment of the umbrella mechanism, as a whole, with respect to its usefulness in carrying out high priority and urgent activities in support of BDG development goals and Mission's priorities; and ii) an assessment of the use of skills of BDG personnel who were trained under the overseas short-term skill-related training programs funded by TRP-II.

1.11 The Evaluation Team has taken into account the following specific objectives in conducting the study:

- (a) Assessment of the need and utility of TRP-II as an umbrella financing mechanism in terms of its flexibility and focus in designing and implementing high priority TA interventions.
- (b) Review of current institutional and procedural problems that beset BDG and USAID in use of TRP-II resources.
- (c) Review of existing design, approval and implementation processes for TA sub-projects and their constraints, with the objective of recommending changes in these processes.
- (d) Assessment of the focus of selected sub-projects and recommendations for sharpening the focus.
- (e) Assessment of ERD's capabilities as the implementing agency for TRP-II and its role in selection and approval process vis-a-vis ministries.
- (f) Assessment of selection procedures for short-term skill development overseas training; benefits to the recipients; and utilization constraints.
- (g) Review of existing procedures in training needs assessment, critical obstacles in training, and recommended options.

The detailed Terms of Reference and Scope of Work for the Evaluation is attached in Annexure 2.

D. Evaluation Methods

1.12 The Evaluation Team carried out a comprehensive review of all relevant documents on the Project including the evaluations of completed sub-projects funded by TRP-II, the preliminary draft of the Missions's strategic statements, and Mission's Manual Order (1988). In addition, the Team reviewed the World Bank's Country Strategy (1994), the UNDP Study on Public Administration (1993), the BDG's fourth 5 Year Plan, and the BDG Guidelines on Aid Utilization (1992). A complete list of the documents reviewed is attached as Annexure 3.

1.13 The Team held meetings and interviews, more than once in many cases, with BDG officials in ERD, the Planning Commission, and the Ministry of Establishment (MOE). The Team also visited BPATC and held discussions with the faculty members and program coordinator, especially with regards to implementation problems of DMT component. In addition, members of the Team met with the senior members of Bangladesh Institute of Administration and Management (BIAM) and attended training sessions conducted by BIAM to gain first-hand information on its programs and planned activities.

1.14 A detailed interview guide, based on the scope of work, was prepared and used in interviews with BDG officials. The recorded responses are synthesized into a summary of BDG perspective vis-v-vis TRP-II and is attached as Annexure 4.

1.15 On the side of the USAID Mission, the Team held meetings with director, deputy director, program officer, evaluation specialist of the program office, project manager of TRP-II, and concerned project officers in the technical offices. The Team also held discussions with officials of the World Bank and UNDP resident missions. List of individuals interviewed is attached as Annexure 5.

1.16 A survey of a selected sample of participants who received short-term overseas skill development training under TRP-II was designed and carried out. The survey used both a structured checklist and an open-ended interview guide. A total of 18 participants were covered under the survey. In three cases, interviews were conducted with groups of participants who received the training as a group. Given sufficient unanimity within these groups, the responses of each of these groups were treated as a single response, thus reducing the size of sample to a total of 13. On the basis of the survey, the Team developed 5 case studies as "self-assessments" of the participants which were recorded in writing at the time of interviews.

1.17 The findings from the survey are contained in chapter-III section A of this report. The list of the participants, the survey checklist, and the five case studies are attached as Annexure 6.

CHAPTER II

FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS - TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Overall Assessment

1.1 The Evaluation Team has examined the problems that presently beset the use of TRP-II resources as a result of the BDG's current policy to apply uniform guidelines in design and approval of technical assistance projects. Apparently, BDG's emphasis on applying uniform guidelines stems from the concerns to streamline its development portfolio management and budgetary process. The BDG's present position calls for revising the notion of TRP-II flexibility in bilateral terms. Bilaterally, future activities under TRP-II will require a consensus between USAID and ERD and hence flexibility will be constrained by the consensus building process.

1.2 The evaluation indicates that USAID was able to utilize TRP-II umbrella financing as a flexible and quick-response device to undertake critical activities in the past without having to go through time consuming BDG procedures. We believe that USAID was able to exert this unilateral flexibility partly due to a "liberal" environment and decentralized practices in project approval within BDG ministries in the past.

1.3 We understand that uniform BDG guidelines presently apply to all projects including TRP-II. This implies that flexibility as one of the critical features of TRP-II will be a function of negotiability and consensus between ERD and USAID in designing future TRP-II activities. In addition, a strict application of formal guidelines is not yet evident in BDG and we also understand that the Planning Commission is considering to introduce some relaxations to the uniform guidelines. Therefore, we believe that an active process of consultation and consensus building between USAID and ERD becomes necessary to defend TRP-II from the likely rigidity of the BDG guidelines.

1.4 We also understand that an informal approach for developing consensus has been agreed between ERD and USAID. In this regard, we consider the present consultative arrangements and coordination between USAID and ERD as a significant positive step. We recommend that this consultative process should be strengthened by: a) strengthening ERD project management capacity and information processing procedures; and b) by USAID and ERD mutually adopting a collaborative approach to plan a series of TA and training activities.

1.5 According to this Evaluation, the focus of the TRP-II sub-activities in technical assistance and training do not appear to be a function of deliberately planned priorities. Four of the nine sub-projects namely IPSA, BFPP, FMPU, HRD/Winrock funded by TRP-II are essentially carry-overs from TRP-I; and three of the sub-projects namely IPSA, Flood Action Plan (FAP), Export Development, are in support of initiatives by other donors. Of the remaining two, Dhaka Stock Exchange (DSE) is a unilateral obligation, and the Public Administration Efficiency Study (PAES), a BDG initiative, the recommendations of which remain to be implemented by the Government. This suggests a lack of framework for selection and

prioritization. It further suggests that TRP-II activities have been largely supply-driven and that the TRP-II resources appear to search for 'fundable' activities, rather than the opposite.

1.6 According to this Evaluation, selection of TA sub-projects has been a bit ad-hoc and too diffused which makes it difficult to consolidate the gains of TRP-II investments in improving BDG's technical and managerial capacities. The overall objective of TRP being the improvement of BDG's technical and managerial capacity requires technical assistance in support of development of core competencies, quality manpower, and better management practices. Technical assistance directed at discreet sectors may not help to build the overall capacity in the Government. Hence, there is a need to sharpen the focus of TRP-II within a coherent framework. We propose that the Project should adopt public administration as an overall framework for its future operations. In addition, collaborative planning should be undertaken within the following proposed parameters: i) integrated planning of technical assistance and training activities directed to capacity building in BDG; ii) support to build qualitative aspects of training; iii) sustainability considerations in determining future operations; and iv) mutually agreed procedures for defining priorities.

1.7 Justifications for TRP-II follow-on appear weak if judged against the changing environment. Implementing obligations under TRP-II (particularly the DMT component) are lagging behind, and it is doubtful if the entire funds could be utilized in piece-meal method and yet produce good results. Future planning of TRP-II activities is going to be undertaken within "bounded flexibility" resulting from the uniform application of BDG guidelines for TA design and approval. Future planning is also expected to be more demand-driven rather than supply-driven. However, institutional capacity in BDG and especially in ERD to create the presumed demand is limited. To facilitate future planning and maintain a degree of flexibility, we recommend that once USAID and ERD mutually agree upon an initial project concept or activity that USAID could directly assist the concerned client institution in design of the project and preparation of TAPP. Furthermore, ERD should ensure an expeditious approval of planned activities.

B. Impact on USAID and BDG Priorities

1.8 TRP-II was designed to redress long delays that incur in design and approval of stand-alone projects as well as a means of quickly responding to the priorities of USAID and BDG. The original intent in its substance has been met by TRP-II except for the problems in project closures. A failure to close projects in time, funded under an umbrella mechanism, tends to produce negative externalities in the forms of cost over-runs, inadequate monitoring, and neglect of standard procurement procedures. We believe that a number of sub-projects funded under TRP-II have suffered from such negative externalities.

1.9 TRP-II has financed a variety of technical assistance and training activities and in some cases provided co-financing to other donors (Japan in IPSA, and the World Bank in Export Promotion Development). The impacts of TRP-II supported technical assistance can be broadly summarized as:

- (a) Support to policy reforms and institution building in mutual BDG and USAID priority sectors.
- (b) Introduction of modern MIS and analytic methods in BDG institutions.

- (c) Improvements in in-country policy analysis and research capacity in agriculture sector.
- (d) Transfer of modern skills through training.

The above capacity building measures have been achieved in terms of operational outputs of the sub-projects. This Evaluation, on the basis of the review of the sub-projects, however, indicates that some of the gains have been insufficient to provide sustainable operations due to frequent rotations and loss of trained personnel in the client institutions as well as due to insufficient progress on required policy reforms on the part of BDG. We recommend that TRP-II criteria and its activities should explicitly take into account sustainability considerations in project design and monitoring.

1.10 The Evaluation has also attempted to examine the effects of TRP-II funded activities in improving the management of Mission's regular portfolio. The visible effects of TRP-II on the Mission's portfolio can be summarized as:

- (a) The TRP-II sub-projects were instrumental in producing synergistic effects, especially in agriculture and food sectors thus contributing to overall quality of the Mission portfolio.
- (b) TRP-II enhanced sustainability of USAID's investments by institutionalizing policy changes in agriculture and food sectors.
- (c) TRP-II supported other donor initiatives and helped improve inter-donor coordination.
- (d) TRP-II increased labor-intensity in project management on the part of Mission's technical offices.
- (e) TRP-II utilized "less competitive" money for certain low impact activities, especially for training.
- (f) TRP-II adversely affected standard project monitoring norms.
- (g) TRP-II created significant problems in project closures.

C. Specific Problems

Project Design and Approval

1.11 Generally speaking, the aid utilization environment and limited absorptive capacity in BDG combined with complex and cumbersome procedures both on the part of donors and BDG result in delays in project approval, fund release, procurement, staff appointments, etc. These general constraints in aid utilization apply to all donor assisted projects. Although, various measures have been taken by BDG and donors to overcome these problems, the overall environment remains inflexible. TRP-II and its utility as an umbrella Project is equally confined by this development assistance environment.

1.12 Technical Assistance Project Proformas (TAPP) are prepared at the ministry, department, and agency level. Structure and format of TAPP have been improved through technical assistance provided by UNDP. However, technical quality and comprehensiveness of TAPPs continue to be inadequate due to the low level of motivation and technical skills of staff. The planning cells of the ministries are inadequately staffed and there are no particular incentives to recruit and keep good planners. At the level of Planning Commission, TAPPs are reviewed and often more than once. These reviews are perfunctory in nature and TAPPs are not granted sufficient attention due to, among other factors, the fact there is no capital investment tied to them.

1.13 BDG has prepared detailed guidelines on preparation and approval procedures of TAPP. These guidelines, in our view, are comprehensive and provide valuable directions for preparing quality TAPPs. Various elements of the guidelines include, among others, strategies for human resource development, implementation and follow-up of training, and modalities for successful transfer of technology, etc. However, the guidelines are not followed mainly for lack of adequate skills, training, and motivation on the part of BDG personnel responsible for preparation of TAPPs. Furthermore, there is no management process and accountability to ensure application of the planning guidelines. We suggest that USAID in consultation with ERD should explore the possibility of creating an on-the-job training program to train personnel in the planning cells of core ministries in the application of the BDG guidelines.

1.14 The approval procedures are centralized and often repetitious with limited discretion to ministries and departments. The time limits prescribed for review process are not followed. Political interference and bureaucratic indifference adds to the delays in the approval of TAPPs.

1.15 The Planning Commission does not have a system to determine and plan priorities. It depends on individuals and their perception of priorities. In current practice, the elected politicians tend to exert significant influence over planning functions. The political view of "priorities" may not be consistent with the actual needs. Requirements of repeated approval by the Ministers both during the planning and implementation stages, cause delays. In addition, the Planning Commission tends to get too involved in project-specific details than perform macro-planning functions which is its basic mandate.

1.16 Regardless of the merits and de-merits of BDG guidelines, we recommend that ERD take necessary initiatives to utilize TRP-resources in a demand-driven manner. In addition, the present "tacit" rules of consultation and coordination should be explicitly spelled out, perhaps in the form of a Handbook or a Planning Guide for future design and approval of TRP-II activities.

CHAPTER III

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS - TRAINING

A. Overseas Skill Development Training under TRP-II

Criteria

1.1 The BDG criteria for selection of participants for overseas training prescribes that nominees should be permanent employees; should have 4-5 years of service; and should have relevant academic background. In addition, candidates for long-term degree and short-term non-degree should not be over 40 and 45 years in age, respectively. The criteria does not include merit, performance, or language proficiency in selection of participants.

1.2 The criteria which applies to project related short-term skill training is also applied to TRP-II funded training except that project related training has a clear focus in terms of actual skill development. There is nothing in the criteria that provides a similar focus to TRP-II. In addition, the criteria puts qualified female candidates in the Government and individuals in the private sector in a dis-advantaged position. The proportion of females class I officers in the civil service remains relatively small compared to the overall strength of the service. Out of the total 113 participants of TRP-II funded training, there are only 10 females. The existing criteria, among other cultural and gender factors, subscribes to the under-representation of females. We recommend that the existing BDG criteria should be broadened to incorporate measures for determining personal competence and motivations of candidates. An indigenous test could be developed for this purpose with assistance from local professionals*.

Nomination and Selection Procedures

1.3 The past practice when the Ministry of Establishment (MOE) was responsible for nomination and selection of all participants for overseas training is replaced by the present decentralized procedures. MOE, upon receiving short-term training facilities under TRP-II from ERD convenes a meeting of its Allocation Committee. ERD is represented on this Committee. The Committee reviews the offers with respect to "skill requirements" in different sectors and different ministries and agencies. After this "sorting exercise", MOE channels "appropriate" groups of training offers to "appropriate" ministries and organizations. Nomination and selection is undertaken at the levels of respective ministries and departments who have their own allocation committees for this purpose. In our view, the present decentralized

* For instance, the Government of Indonesia's Office of Training has developed and successfully applied, with USAID's Assistance, a set of indigenized tests to evaluate personal/cultural competence and motivation of candidates selected for foreign training. The post-test results indicate that the profiles of selected candidates are significantly different from those who were selected during the pre-test period. The results show that levels of competence and motivation of those selected through indigenized tests are significantly higher than of those selected earlier.

procedures are inappropriate for selection of qualified participants according to a uniform and objective criteria.

1.4 Final selection of candidates requires the approval from the prime minister for joint secretary and above levels of officers and the approval of concerned secretaries for the deputy secretary and below levels of officers.

1.5 According to USAID requirements, selected candidates for short-term training must take and qualify the English Language Tests (ALI/GU) in order to avail the training opportunity. This requirement is occasionally waived for senior officers under the assumption that senior civil servants have requisite language proficiency.

1.6 Objectivity and transparency of nomination and selection procedures is difficult to maintain in the absence of training plans based on needs and for a lack of objectivity in uniform application of the criteria. Based on our interview with the participants and others, we also understand that the training offers are not widely circulated and more availed by BCS (admin) cadre in comparison to other cadres.

1.7 We recommend that ERD should consider establishing a standing committee comprising of representatives of concerned ministries and outside experts for selection of participants under a uniform criteria that includes merit as a primary consideration. Further, we recommend that ERD should ensure wider and timely circulation of training offers.

Participants' Survey

1.8 Approximately, 113 persons have received, both formal and informal short-term as well as long-term degree training under TRP-II. A structured survey combined with interviews of a selected sample of participants receiving short-term (2-20 weeks) formal overseas training was conducted to determine benefits, relevance, and utilization. The total sample size of 13 consisted of 4 group and 10 individual responses. About 40% of the sample consisted of females. The results are presented in the Tables on the following page.

General Benefits

1.9 The results of the survey indicate that approximately 75 percent of the participants benefitted from the training in terms of personal and professional enhancement; 33 percent in terms of career advancement; and about 50 percent in terms of acquiring new skills. The majority of the participants expressed an overall satisfaction with the training programs, were able to develop professional contacts, and appreciated the exposure to other cultures.

Job relevance

1.10 Approximately 25 percent of the participants considered their training adequately relevant to their professional and academic background as well as to the functional responsibilities of their present job. About 50 percent of the participants found the training to be "somewhat" relevant to their professional background and their functional responsibilities. The remaining 25 percent indicated that the training had no relevance.

PARTICIPANTS' SURVEY FINDINGS

(Sample Size: 13, Total Participants: 18)

Table 1: General Benefits

Professional Enhancement	Career Advancement	Cultural Exposure	Professional Contacts/ Development	Acquisition of New Skills	Personal Satisfaction		
					High	Low	Medium
9	4	12	11	7		8	5

Table 2: Relevance

High Relevance	Medium Relevance	Low	Non-Relevance
3	6	3	1

Table 3: Utilization

Utilization				Areas of Utilization				
				Formal Utilization				Informal Utilization
High	Medium	Low	None	Policy Related	Project Related	Management Related	Technical Research	
3	3	3	4	3	3	5	4	5

Table 4: Constraints of Utilization

Misplacement	Lack of Equipment/ Supplies/ Resources/ Poor Work Procedures	Lack of Qualified Staff	Lack of Support from Supervisors/ Delegation of Authority	Too many other responsibility	Resistance to change by others	Training was not applicable to local conditions
4	8	5	6	7	5	7

Utilization

1.11 Regarding utilization, 25 percent participants indicated that they were able to utilize some of the acquired skills in their present job. About 50 percent found limited opportunities to apply the acquired skills to their job, and the remaining 25 percent indicated no utilization and applicability of their acquired skills.

1.12 Regarding the functional or technical areas to which acquired skills were applied, the results indicate that participants were able to utilize the skills in a limited manner by making occasional inputs into project design, policy development, management improvements, and research. About 50 percent of the participants pointed out that application of acquired skills was more a result of their personal and informal initiative rather than related to functional responsibilities of their jobs. A majority of those who acquired technical and computer-related skills either left their jobs or could not apply the skills for lack of proper organizational environment and support.

Constraints to Utilization

1.13 The findings indicate that organizational structures and work procedure, lack of guidance and improper delegation of work from the supervisors, lack of equipment, misplacement, and non-applicability of training to local conditions are the main impediments.

1.14 Findings from the survey and personal interviews with the participants also indicate that utilization of acquired skills by the participants is dependent upon appropriate selection and their personal traits than merely on training. Some of the participants reported to have taken personal initiatives in applying the acquired skills for some time. However, institutional constraints and resistance to change from others in the organization made it difficult to continue to take initiative and apply acquired skills.

General Findings

1.15 The limited size of the sample combined with lack of objectively verifiable indicators in the survey methods and time constraint make it difficult to generalize from the findings. However, the survey results, interviews with BDG officials, and findings from related studies point out certain tentative conclusions:

- (a) Motivation is a major part in learning and in applying new skills. Acquiring and utilizing skills on part of participants, in short-term courses, is related to appropriate selection (selecting the right person for the right training). The present selection procedures do not explicitly take into account competence and motivational factors (see case studies 1#2 in Annexure 6).
- (b) Functional requirements of jobs in BDG are not clearly specified in some cases and not adhered to in majority of the cases. Supervisors do not provide encouragement and

guidance. There is limited delegation from the top and most often the middle level officers do what their superiors want them to do on a day-to day basis. All of these factors serve as constraints to utilization of acquired skills:

- (c) Proper selection of participants is adversely affected by lack of assessment of organizational and skill requirements. The selection system is more personal-oriented than need-based. As a result, wrong people are trained for wrong reasons (see case studies #3, 4, and 5, Annexure 6).
- (d) The English language proficiency requirement, as the only verifiable element of selection criteria, may discriminate against those who may be otherwise eligible in terms of their competence and motivation. Demonstrated proficiency in English in isolation from other factors such as competence and merit tends to bias the selection in favor of those having better command of English. Some of the participants in the survey pointed out that insufficient grasp of English on their part had a detrimental effect on expected learning.
- (e) The participant survey and interviews conducted suggest that females display relatively higher motivation and take an active interest in applying acquired skills and hence female candidates should deserve special attention. In our view, active targeting of female officers in BDG through non-governmental and independent means may help to increase utilization of the Women in Development (WID) component in TRP-II.

1.16 The findings from the survey, though tentative, suggest a lack of clear benefits of overseas training in terms of skill development in BDG. We recommend that USAID and ERD should take appropriate measures in improving selection methods and design of training programs. Further, we recommend that USAID should consider utilization of regional training institutions to the maximum possible and in appropriate areas which will help to reduce cost, and improve relevance of training, on account of similarities in learning environments among regional countries. Use of regional training institutions will also help to develop linkages between BPATC and other institutions and facilitate frequent exchange of faculty and other resources at affordable costs.

B. Obstacles to TRP-II Funded Training

Training Needs Assessment

1.17 There are no systematic procedures in BDG for assessing needs of in-country and overseas training although the National Training Policy provides for regular needs assessment. Design of in-country training programs for BCS (admin) in specific and other cadres in general is implied by the pre-service and in-service requirements prescribed by the Government. These prescribed requirements are geared more toward mid-career paths of the BCS (admin) cadre officers. The requirements are not necessarily linked to career development, especially in case of senior level officers.

1.18 BPATC, which is under the administrative control of MOE, provides pre-service and in-service training to class I officers of all cadres. Cadre-specific training of class I officers is the responsibility of the concerned ministries and is provided in affiliated training institutions. We understand that BPATC assesses training needs through indirect methods based on the self-assessments of trainees and review of changes in BDG priorities and policies, etc. We recommend that BPATC should undertake systematic assessment of training needs through direct and indirect methods as a part of implementing the short-term overseas training and the Development Management Training (DMT) component.

1.19 In absence of actual needs assessment, the linkage between in-country and overseas training is not explicit and not reflected in the selection procedures for overseas training. In the specific context of TRP-II, the present linkage of in-country and overseas training is weak. In-country training component at BPATC appears to be sufficiently focused. The overseas training component requires improved focus and quick placements to provide better linkage and optimize benefits of the overseas training. ERD, as the implementing agency of the Project needs to perform an active role in ensuring appropriate linkage between in-country and TRP-II supported overseas training. At the same time, USAID should assist BPATC in improving the focus of overseas training component in order to improve planning and linkage between in-country and overseas training vis-a-vis ACAD and SSC programs. Short-term overseas training should be planned in a manner that it could take place soon after completion of in-country training.

Institutional Deficiencies

1.20 Supervision and performance evaluation of subordinate officers is deficient in the entire system. There is limited interaction between supervisors and subordinates to evaluate performance and determine training requirements in an objective manner. Supervisors tend to recommend subordinate officers for overseas training on the basis of their individual preferences rather than merit.

1.21 Training, both in-country and overseas, is not directed toward institution building and improving administrative efficiency. The Public Administration Efficiency Study (PAES), funded by TRP-II and carried out on behalf of BDG, undertook detailed analysis of institutional weaknesses in public administration. These weaknesses, which continue to exist, include centralization of authority and lack of delegation, lack of trust and initiative, lack of coordination, overlapping functions, and poor and cumbersome work procedures. We believe that training, in isolation from institutional change and development, holds little promise. We recommend that TRP-II training resources should be explicitly directed toward institutional development through better planning, design, and monitoring of training activities, both in-country and overseas.

1.22 The lack of autonomy of training institutions, including BPATC, serves as a drawback to their institutional development. There is an equal lack of training institutions and programs in the private sector. Bangladesh has lagged behind in development of quality training institutions in public and private sectors as compared to other countries in South and South East Asia.

1.23 Quality of BPATC's programs and faculty is in decline due to the lack of resources and leadership that should be provided by the Government. A close coordination between MOE and ERD is necessary to direct the TRP-II resources to institution building of BPATC.

Dis-incentives

1.24 Qualifications, motivation, and status of training faculty are critical ingredients for building good training programs. The status and incentives of trainers under the present system are so limited that very few qualified individuals aspire for training positions. In fact, professional image of trainers carries a social stigma which serves as a serious dis-incentive.

1.25 The quality and qualifications of BPATC faculty has been in decline. At present, there is only 1 faculty member with Ph.D while there were 8-10 Ph.Ds at BPATC in 1980's. Approximately, half of the present faculty at BPATC consists of government officers, a majority of whom have been deputed at BPATC not necessarily on the basis of their qualifications or willingness.

1.26 The incentives, both monetary and non-monetary, to trainees are insufficient to induce required motivation for learning. According to the Survey conducted during PAES, a majority of officers did not feel inclined to undertake training at BPATC which implied a variety of personal hardships. The findings of the Survey also indicated that in-country training was considered more relevant but less attractive while foreign training was found to be more attractive but less relevant.

1.27 Attitudinal and sub-cultural factors, on part of trainees, serve as constraints to in-country training. Officers belonging to BCS (admin) and other cadres perceive themselves as professional "classes" having their own set of values and image. This suggests a need to make training more demand and client-oriented.

1.28 BPATC and other public sector training institutions suffer from inherent structural and institutional problems including government control, academic orientation, poor quality of faculty, weak programming, and limited monetary and non-monetary incentives. These inherent problems limit the scope of training institutions in public sector in developing into good quality, service-oriented, and economically viable organizations. Therefore, there is a clear need for supporting public or private initiatives in institution building and training which incorporate autonomy, self-financing, and broad based clientele. In this regard a recent initiative taken by the BCS (Admin) Welfare Association in establishing BIAM deserves serious consideration by USAID. A major objective in establishing BIAM, on the part of BCS (admin) Welfare Association, is to address training in the broader context of national and human resource development and to serve as an intermediary in building consensus among bureaucracy, politicians, and the general public. In addition, BIAM envisions its institutional development as a self-reliant, autonomous and service-oriented organization providing training to all. The Evaluation Team is cognizant of the fact that BIAM represents a particular interest group and its development, as envisioned, may be constrained by the interests of its immediate constituency. However, the Evaluation Team believes that BIAM has the potential institutional and intellectual resources necessary to build and implement good quality and development oriented action training programs. We recommend that USAID enter into a dialogue with BIAM toward defining a program which could be supported by TRP-II resources.

WID-Related Training

1.29 Skill-related training, studies, and seminars in WID-related areas comprise one of the components of TRP-II. The purpose of the component is to support activities to minimize the existing gender gaps and provide opportunities to women for increased participation in decision-making and managerial responsibilities, both in public and private sectors. This particular component remains severely under-utilized, for a variety of reasons.

1.30 BDG, on account of its male dominated culture, lacks a real interest in nominating and selecting female candidates for overseas training. The fact that the number of female officers in BDG (about 6.5 percent females in the BCS administrative cadre out of the total of 4,000) requires extra consideration and an active search of female candidates. The number of female participants availing overseas training under TRP-II has been minuscule. On the part of USAID, the procedural restrictions make it difficult to design and support WID-related programs in non-government and private sectors due to bilateral nature of USAID program and stringent project design requirements. Other donors have comparative advantages in this area.

1.31 It would help to identify women's advocacy groups and enlist their services in identifying a eligible pool of female candidates for TRP-II funded training. Based on our discussions with the female members of BCS (admin) Officers Welfare Association who are actively engaged in the current activities of BIAM, we propose that BIAM may be considered as a venue for WID-related programs funded from TRP-II.

Chapter IV

Future Planning

A. Public Administration as a Context

1.1 Lessons learned over a half a century of development experience indicate that an efficient and accountable government is prerequisite for a balanced social and economic development. It has also been demonstrated that this form of government is more capable of taking bold steps to initiate and implement needed policy and institutional changes. In the context of Asia, these lessons also indicate that changes to improve efficiency and accountability in governments are more a function of internal political will and indigenous human and intellectual resources. Donor conditionalities and foreign technical assistance has had limited impact in changing the behavior of governments.

1.2 The present-day development thinking, on the part of USAID and other donors, approaches public administration in broader terms to include governance, public management, participation, regulatory management, civic culture, and improved communication and consensus among the triad (i.e., elected officials, bureaucracy, and the general public). The US Government is in the process of redefining a new mandate for USAID. The new thinking incorporates an emphasis on "good governance" and "social lending". Other bilateral and multi-lateral donors such as the World Bank, UNDP, and Asian development Bank are also adopting these new elements into their lending programs.

B. Decline in BDG's Efficiency

1.3 A continuing and major concern of USAID and other donors in Bangladesh has been related to improving public administration efficiency in the Government. Several studies have been conducted in the last decade, both sponsored by donors and the Government, which have diagnosed major problems in public administration system and made recommendations for efficiency improvements. The Reports identify the problems in specific areas and suggest remedial actions. The PEAS study (1989) jointly sponsored by USAID and BDG and funded by TRP-II integrated the results of the earlier studies in diagnosing major constraints to administrative efficiency and made recommendations. The recommendations of PAES and other studies remain un-implemented by the Government. The recommendation of the various studies in general are too broad requiring changes in the entire structure of the Government which partly explains the reluctance of the Government in implementing the recommendations.

1.4 The Evaluation Team has reviewed the recent studies including PAES as well as discussed efficiency-related issues with the officials in BDG, USAID and other donor and training institutions. The findings from these efforts reconfirm that efficiency in BDG is in serious decline. In fact, there is a crisis in quality and competence in the civil service and especially in the BCS cadre. Those who entered the civil service before independence (1971) and who were well qualified and well trained consist of approximately 80 CSP and 200 EPCS officers presently serving. The majority of these 280 offices will retire by the year 2,000. The present decline is mainly related to the decline in quality of officers entering the civil service in pos-

independence period and is a direct function of their poor training. In addition, frequent changes in BDG's personnel policies have had an adverse effect on the civil service.

1.5 Our assessment also indicates that broad structural reforms in the administrative system could not be undertaken in one stroke, both due to lack of political will of the required magnitude as well as the "unknown implications" of such broad measures. Lessons from the past political experiments in reforming civil service in Bangladesh and in Pakistan conclude that there was more harm than good done by those measures. In comparison, India has achieved higher efficiency in public sector management by taking a series of measures in improving decision-making, delegation of functions, coordination, planning and implementation procedures, and especially by raising the quality of selected segments of civil service through continuous training and incentives to high achievers.

1.6 We propose that TRP-II should concentrate on public administration as a context and as its future focus in order to respond to persistent "capacity gaps" in core spheres of public administration. Some of the critical gaps persist in the following areas:

- (a) Decision-making and communication procedures within the Government.
- (b) Centralization of planning and administration.
- (c) Planning-analytic capability at ministry levels.
- (d) Procedures and information systems necessary to improve design and implementation of projects.
- (e) Quality of manpower at mid career levels.
- (f) Quality of training, proper design of training programs, and linkage between training and career advancement, and between foreign and in-country training.
- (g) Assessments of needs in core competencies at sectoral and sub-sectoral levels that could be used for integrated training and institutional development plans.
- (h) Leadership and involvement of client institutions necessary for sustainable institutional development.

C. TRP-II and its Re-orientation Needs

1.7 We have discussed in the earlier sections the past breadth of focus of TRP-II and its ability to fund a variety of activities. The past focus and selection of TA sub-projects had been legitimately motivated, on the part of the Mission, to consolidate gains in its priority sectors and support initiatives of the BDG and other donors through parallel financing. The past had also been characterized by a "flexible" environment in BDG with regards to approval of TA projects.

1.8 The present and future planning of TRP-II is going to be undertaken within the "bounded flexibility" resulting from the uniformity and centralization of BDG guidelines on TA design and approval and the policy to selectively utilize foreign TA. The future planning is expected to be more demand-driven than supply-driven, in contrast to the past. However, the institutional capacity in BDG and specifically in ERD to create this presumed demand seems limited. Increasing the capacity for creating demand for TRP-II resources should be a part of the Project.

1.9 The change in BDG's orientation to selectively utilize foreign technical assistance is likely to decrease demand for technical assistance and increase demand for training. In the context of TRP-II, this is likely to happen due to stringent technical requirements related to planning and implementing technical assistance programs as compared to that required for implementing ad-hoc training programs.

1.10 TRP-II, as a Project, has contributed toward policy reforms and institutional development in several sectors, and especially in agriculture and food sectors. TRP-II has also served as a catalyst for institution building and human resource development in agriculture sector, as in the case of IPSA and FPMU. These achievements conform well with the overall objectives of the Project. However, sustainability of policy reforms undertaken by the Government remains at stake without institutional reforms and qualitative development in public administration. Sustainability is also necessary to protect USAID's investments and to consolidate emergent gains. We recommend that TRP-II could sharpen the focus of its inputs by re-orienting its resources within the framework of public administration. This proposed reorientation is consistent with current priorities of BDG, USAID, and other donors aimed at improving administrative performance.

1.11 A major problem with providing the required focus to TRP-II supported training has been partly due to inadequate planning of training programs for sustainable qualitative improvements, both in individual and institutional senses. An explicit institutional and human resource development focus is necessary to design technical assistance and training programs. Since the quality of training and technical assistance is crucial to optimize their impact, we recommend that USAID and ERD consider to undertake joint planning in collaboration with other relevant institutions (MOE, BPATC, BIAM, IBA, for example) to plan and program, to the extent possible, an integrated set of future activities to be funded by TRP-II. This exercise should be guided by public administration as an overall context and the following specific parameters:

- (a) Integrated planning of training activities specifically directed to capacity building in core BDG sectors and institutions, including training institutions.
- (b) Support to build qualitative aspect of training institutions.
- (c) Sustainability considerations in determining future technical assistance and training needs or for providing additional support to existing USAID and other donor projects through parallel financing.
- (d) Consensus and mutually agreed procedures in defining USAID and BDG priorities in selecting proposed activities.

1.12 TRP-II is well suited for supporting programs and activities that will respond to the "critical" capacity gaps in public administration. For instance, DMT component could have positive bearing on administrative efficiency, if properly planned and executed. We describe, in the next section, some of the constraints in planning of the DMT component and offer our suggestions. In the next section, we also take the opportunity to recommend a number of prospective activities for consideration of USAID and BDG. These activities, in our view, are consistent with the past focus as well as with our recommended parameters for TRP-II future operations. Proper planning of these activities will require support of both the USAID and ERD and a collaborative and participatory planning approach with involvement of intended beneficiary institutions. An action plan to help design the following proposed components is attached as Annexure 7.

D. Proposed Planning Activities (Existing and Future)

DMT Component

1.13 The DMT sub-component activities are discretely formulated with no specified links between and among them. TRP-II as a project and the DMT as its component are aimed at improving managerial and technical capacity in the Government and to help build training capacity of local institutions. The integration of DMT sub-component activities within an institutional development framework is necessary.

1.14 The respective roles of ERD, MOE, and BPATC in coordinating, planning and implementing the DMT components are not sufficiently shared. We recommend that ERD should take the initiative to determine respective roles and responsibilities of ERD, MOE, BPATC and other recipient institutions of DMT funding and provide the needed coordination and approval for an early implementation of the DMT component, as an integrated plan.

1.15 BPATC, being the main beneficiary of DMT components, should develop an integrated plan for DMT inputs, for both in-country and overseas training. Involvement of BMDC, APD, IBA, and other training institutions will be necessary in this process. BPATC should also develop an annual implementation plan based on the integrated plan as suggested or convert the integrated plan into a 3 year sub-project.

1.16 ERD, in consultation with the USAID, should review the annual plan/sub-project, as the case may be. Upon a satisfactory review of the annual plan/sub-project, we recommend that approval should be given by ERD by signing a Project Implementation Letter (PIL). BPATC should be designated as the implementing institution under the PIL agreement.

Support for Institutional Development of BIAM

1.17 BIAM is a private initiative of the BCS Officers's Welfare Association. The Association has about 4000 members. BIAM was established, as a training institution, to meet the critical gaps in training and administrative development. At present, BIAM is in nascent stages of development and limited funding is provided by BDG for its development.

1.18 The mandate of BIAM is to become an autonomous and self-reliant training institution to provide quality training in response to the needs of public and private sector development. BIAM is an emerging training institution that has a large and distinguished constituency representing the core of present civil service. An important objective of BIAM is to complement the resources of existing training institution and specifically of BPATC and to provide training to all cadres in areas not covered by the existing training institutions. These features provide BIAM with significant institutional resources. It also provides it a continuous stream of well qualified and experienced trainers. Additional details on BIAM are attached as Annexure 8.

1.19 The Evaluation Team recommends that USAID consider supporting BIAM's initiatives through TRP-II resources. Based on our discussions with the senior members of BIAM, we understand that BIAM is interested in developing a detailed proposal for potential funding from TRP-II.

Support for WID-Related Training and Institutional Development

1.20 Skill-related training and other WID-related studies and seminars comprise one of the components of TRP-II. This particular component has remained under-utilized for various reasons. The number of female participants availing overseas training under TRP-II has been minuscule.

1.21 Apparently, WID-related programs appear to be under-invested due to the limited access to donors and weak implementation capacity of the BDG's Directorate of Women's Affairs. We discussed with Directorate officials the institutional strengthening requirements for effective implementation of their employment generating activities. We understand that a number of donors are in the process of designing and funding a project to strengthen the Directorate. The USAID, while not funding the project, participates in the Working Group of the institutional strengthening study. We recommend that TRP-II funds should be utilized in support of this multi-donor project, if needed.

1.22 It would also help to identify women's advocacy groups and enlist their services in identifying a eligible pool of female candidates for TRP-II funded training. Based on our discussions with the female members of the BCS (admin) Officers Welfare Association who are actively engaged in the current activities of BIAM, we propose that BIAM should design WID-related programs for possible funding from TRP-II. This could materialize in the form of supporting development of a specialized training section within BIAM which will focus on design and delivery of training on WID-related issues.

1.23 The participants' survey and interviews conducted under this Evaluation indicate that females have relatively higher motivation and are more active in applying acquired skills to their jobs. In our view, improvements in criteria, nomination and selection procedures, and active-targeting may maximize opportunities for females in overseas training and increase utilization of WID component of TRP-II. Also, we recommend that USAID and ERD employ "equal opportunity" considerations in selecting candidates for overseas training and for training of trainers under the DMT Component.

ERD Capacity Building

1.24 ERD, as the implementing agency for TRP-II Program has substantially improved its coordination and consultative functions both with respect to USAID and BDG line ministries. The improvements have occurred as a result of the present strong leadership and competent staff. The working relationship between ERD and USAID in deciding upon TRP-II related matters is considered satisfactory by both parties.

1.25 The staff resources relative to the amount of work in ERD are limited. Both ERD and USAID could certainly benefit from additional staff, preferably with technical qualifications and experience in project design and approval. We recommend that ERD and USAID should discuss the issue of understaffing and take corrective actions. In our view, it seems desirable to provide additional technical personnel to ERD, on contractual basis, to be supported from the Project funds.

1.26 The coordinating functions in ERD require quick access and retrieval of information thus pointing the need for an Management information System (MIS). At present, ERD finds it difficult to maintain easily accessible records of TA and training activities supported by TRP-II. We recommend that ERD should consider strengthening its MIS by specifically establishing a properly equipped and manned network system with custom-designed software, which can be operated by ERD officers with minimum effort. This could be very useful for ERD in playing a pro-active role in future planning and decision-making with respect to TRP-II type activities.

Sustainability-Support Activities

1.27 A primary consideration for future TRP-II support should be sustainability requirements as a an important element of the sub-project selection criteria. For example, major reforms in agriculture input markets and structural changes in food grain markets have been undertaken by BDG. USAID has played a significant role by utilizing TRP mechanism, thus consolidating the gains of its earlier investments in these sectors. We understand that a separate Integrated Food Development project has been planned as a follow-on and will be financed by USAID. This type of follow-on projects and activities are necessary for sustainability and future policy and institutional development in key sectors. We recommend that USAID undertake a review of TA sub-projects funded under TRP-II and especially those which relate to USAID's present priorities, identify sustainability gaps, and design supportive TA and training activities in close coordination with relevant BDG agencies.

List of Annexures

1. Documentary Review
2. Terms of Reference for Mid-term Evaluation
3. Documents Reviewed
4. BDG Perspective on TRP-II: A Summary of Interviews with BDG Officials
5. List of Individuals Interviewed
6. Self Assessment (Case Studies)
7. Action Plan
8. Bangladesh Institute of Administration and Management
9. Directorate of Women's Affairs
10. Resumes of Team Members

ANNEXURE 1

Documentary Review

The T.A-related objectively verifiable indicators of TRP-II sub-projects are assembled below. These have been sourced from the available Reports and Technical Offices related to each sub-project.

Sub-Projects /status (evaluation) /project digest	Macro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training	Micro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training
Employment & Small Enterprise Policy /completed (evaluated)	* focus on industrial policy * focus on logical framework * exposed GOB skill limits - in-country & overseas training - innovative analytical tools	* Data banking * Time series analyses * Set Primary data survey - set up Computer skills - technical manpower
Project Digest: Life: 1987-90 USAID\$ n.a Cost O/Run? n.a Time O/Run? n.a	Refer: An Evaluation of the HIID/ESEPP Project Hagglblade, Jahan & Young, May 1990 Inputs: Expatriate Advisors, Subject Specialists, Computers, Software development, surveys, Training, Seminars/Workshops, Study tours Recomn: a) Organize the Primary (survey) data b) Review and sustain the Analysis cells c) Train and research manpower d) Policy-making by cross-industry analyses	
USAID Office: not available No project verifications could be carried out.		

BD Food Policy /completed (evaluated)	* 64 Food Policy Reform Papers * Cost control @ \$113mn/year - 7 Seminars on Policy Issues, - 8 Specialized training in USA	* Computer systems/skills * 12 Policy papers - Analytical tools/system - 13 in-country Training course (trained 96 officials)
Project Digest: Life: Dec 88-Jun 94 US \$4,730,000 Cost O/run? Yes Time O/run? Yes	Refer: Final Evaluation:BD Food Policy Project, Tropical R&D Inc, April 1993 Inputs: 2 Advisors, Subject Specialists, Training, Seminar, Institution-building, 17 Computers, Software design Recomn: a) Continue Training for Institution building b) Develop Computer system & Skills c) Continuous MIS update, Research, training	

USAID Office: Agriculture & Food Policy Division

1. GOB desired closure. A Follow-on project (IFFD) has been jointly designed by BDG-USAID in order to reduce TAPP negotiating and implementing issues.
2. Approved T.As need complete freedom for implementing their mandates, and procedural supervision should be limited to monitoring progress of tasks.

3. Distribution of responsibilities between ERD and Line Ministries should be sufficient to rationalize task supervisions and operations accountability.

Sub-Projects /status (evaluation) /project digest	Macro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training	Micro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training
Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) /completed (not evaluated)	* 4 Food Policy Analyses * Reduced rural rationing - Technical/Analysis skills - 8 FPMU Officials trained in USA on Food policies - Regular monitoring of Food situation strengthened Database	* Market-based operations * Open Bank operations - Monitoring & Evaluation - MoF Officials trained in USA on marketing

Project Digest:
Life: Dec 88 - Jun 94
US\$270,000
Cost O/run? Yes
Time O/run? Yes

Refer: nil
Inputs: Research costs, Salary, Travel and Equipments
Recomn:

USAID Office: Agriculture & Food Policy Division

1. FPMU is a spin-off from a World Bank study. It was started under TRP-I and carried into TRP-II. No new TAPP was prepared for its operation.
2. TRP-II operations has established the merits of FPMU, and it has now been institutionalized under M/o Food's revenue operations.
3. There was conflict between ERD and User in monitoring FPMU progress, and reallocating funds --- these tend to affect project cycles.
4. ERD and USAID agreed to close FPMU because of need to meet the TRP-II criteria.

Export Development /partly ongoing (evaluated)	* Boosting national exports * using EDF (rose from only \$150,000 to \$20mn at EOP) * reducing Duty Drawback time (from 6 months to 7 days at EOP) - Training of DEDO manpower - Seminar of Bankers on EDF	* Computer system at EPB * Research and support to trade bodies/exporters - MIS installed at EPB - MIS installed at SBC
--	--	---

Project Digest:
Life: Aug 90- Aug 93
US\$ 1.60mn
Cost O/run? No
Time O/run? Yes

Refer: Final Evaluation of USAID Funded Export
Development Project, DAI, Sep 1993
Inputs: Expatriate Consultants, Software & Analysis tools,
Training, Study tours, Computers, Workshops
Recomn: a) Strengthen Export & Trade organizations
b) Privatize Promotion/Regulation functions
c) Develop manpower, MIS, skills, Research
d) Donor coordination for foreign investment

USAID Office: Economic Enterprise

1. BDG requested this T.A in Aug,90 for availing the WB Export credit-line; Contractors were selected in Apr,91 but work got held up the Gulf War;

2. Planning Commission took 6-months to approve Local Computer software development, and underlines the difficulty in running TRP-II on time. 4 Agencies (BB, NBR, EPB and SBC) of this project needed own TAPP under coordination by ERD --- the procedural issues were phenomenal.
 3. Mission intensely supervised the sub-project (and hence, the success) to bolster the performance of the weaker Agencies.
 4. Staff turnover is a very serious constraint -- DEDO had 6 D.Gs during the project cycle and this visibly affected institutional motivation.
-

Sub-Projects /status (evaluation) /project digest	Macro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training	Micro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training
Institute of Post-Graduate Study in Agriculture (IPSA) /completed (evaluated)	* Post-Graduate specialization in agriculture set up * Co-financing with Japan (curricula/faculty support) - Agriculture extension - 5 Ph.Ds from USA - new products development	* Laboratories set up * Library developed * Computer system set up * Experimental Farms set up - Post-Graduate studies - M.S. curriculae - social & policy analyses

Project Digest:
Life: Apr 86- Nov 93
US\$ 2.97mn
Cost O/run? Yes
Time O/run? Yes

Refer: Jt Tripartite Evaluation of IPSA in BD, July 1989
Inputs: Consultants, Training, Library, Laboratory,
Computer systems, institutional support
Recomn: a) Continue institutional support
b) Assist infrastructure & software growth
c) Coordinate co-financing to optimize inputs

USAID Office: Agriculture Development Division

1. USAID initiative under Agriculture Support, and pursued through TRP-I. No new TAPP as ERD cooperated through PIL. Later a PP was prepared for IPSA's formal needs and Planning Commission's delayed approval till 1989.
2. Mission closed sub-project due to shifts in its country strategy. 3. Project administration was affected by lack of clear-cut responsibility between co-financiers and with BDG Agencies.
4. Project benefitted from Contractor's skills in institution development.

Human Resources Development at BARC by WinRock /completed (evaluated)	* Improving Research capacity * Strengthening NARS InfoBank * Policy-making software design - 8 Ph.Ds from USA & Philippine - seminars on policies-issues	* Research financing * 14 Computer systems * Monitoring FSR data - 9 Study grants(Ph.D/MS) - data management skill
--	---	--

Project Digest:
Life: 1984-93
US \$1.82mn
Cost O/run? Yes
Time O/run? Yes

Refer: Evaluation of the Winrock International
Human Resources Development in BD, DAI, Sep 1991
Inputs: 2 Advisors, 5 Subject Specialists, 11 Computers,
Directory, Training, Seminars, Software designs
Recomn: a) Sustain HRDP through post-project funding
b) Plan for long-term strategy and research
c) Continue RSSN Seminars, Training & Workshops
d) Update Computer training and designing

USAID Office: Agriculture Development Division

1. Carry-over from TRP-I and Agriculture Support program. Later, TAPP was prepared and approval received because of strong interventions.
2. Contractor was selected by mutual cooperation, and they played a very role in meeting targeted outputs despite procedural delays.
3. Mission has closed project due to shifts in its country strategy.
4. Sustainability of sub-project will be affected due to BDG's failure to plan for consolidating and building up the critical T.A gains.

Sub-Projects /status (evaluation) /project digest	Macro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training	Micro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training
Support for Flood Action Plan /ongoing (evaluated)	* Planning/analyzing skills * Establishing GIS - advanced overseas training - on-the-job' training	* Computers & training * Software designing - 2 in-country courses - databasing techniques
Project Digest: Life: n.a. US\$ n.a. Cost O/run? n.a. Time O/run? n.a.	Refer: nil Inputs: Advisors, Subject Specialists, Computers, Training, Research, Seminars, Surveys Recomn: not available	
USAID Office: Not available No project verifications could be carried out.		

Support for DSE /completed (evaluated)	* Importing modern concepts * Strengthening institution * Capacity for Training, Research * Plan for automation in trade - MIS system installed - Installing O&M practices	* Computer hardware * Transaction monitoring * Foreign Consultant input - Study tours - Computer cell manpower - MBA internships
--	---	---

Project Digest: Life: Dec 91 - Sep 93 US\$ 273,000 Cost O/run? No Time O/run? No	Refer: Dhaka Stock Exchange: Final Evaluation Prof B/Majumder, Washington University, Sep 1993 Inputs: Expatriate Consultants, Local Specialists, Computer and Software, Training, Institutional Planning Recomn: a) Prepare Action Plan for Reorganization b) Phased Plan for Automation of Transactions c) Develop Research Capability and InfoBank d) Install Education and Training programs
--	---

USAID Office: Economic Enterprise

1. BDG took 1 year to approve the TAPP despite the close support of the private sector and in-country Contractor (Asia Foundation).
2. Mission is not interested in follow-on project as T.A has revealed vested interests against institutional restructuring.

Sub-Projects /status (evaluation) /project digest	Macro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training	Micro focussed Output * Technical Assistance - Training
BD Public Administration Efficiency Study /completed (not evaluated)	* Plan for reorganization * Promoting efficiency * MIS and Management audit * Guidelines for accountability	* Guidelines for HRD * Modernizing Office System * Improving project cycle * Work Environment/logistics
Project Digest: Life : USAID\$...... Cost O/run? Time O/run?	Refer: nil Inputs: Advisors, Subject Specialists, strategic plans, Surveys/Interviews/Workshops, software designs Recomn: a) Perspective Plan for Institution development b) Guidelines for Phased Implementation c) Review of Rule of Business d) Streamlining Project cycle and Procurements e) Introducing Accountability & Professionalism f) Personnel, Training and Skill utilization	

USAID Office: Mission Office

1. BDG under scrutiny for taking up Administrative reforms without delay. Finance Minister assured 1994 Paris Consortium to do this by Dec, 1994. There is some effort by BDG Ministers'/Secretaries' Committees on this matter, but Donor have not observed any significant progress so far.
 2. Mission views Public Administration as a critical input for TRP-II; some movements have been made in taking up DMT with BPATC as Lead User.
 3. Pace of implementation is too slow and will not fulfil TRP-II selection criteria (36 months). Execution process needs to be streamlined.
 4. TRP-II has been a flexible mechanism to assist BDG. However, the recent procedural reforms within BDG regarding "General Guideline for Projects", and "TA component not exceeding 20% of outlay" may affect TRP-II.
 5. Mission is itself reviewing its strategic planning and this has been a cause from withdrawing from R&D projects like IPSA, etc. Mission however views good Public Administration as an input for "poverty alleviation".
-

ANNEXURE 2

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR MID-TERM EVALUATION

The purpose of this evaluation is to help the Mission and BDG improve the usefulness of TRP-II in strengthening the managerial and technical effectiveness of BDG in planning, implementing, and evaluating development programs based on the evaluation teams assessment of the projects progress and performance to date and its judgment on where and how the project can and should most usefully be directed in its remaining life. The scope of this evaluation is focused in two areas:

- (a) Usefulness of the TRP-II as a flexible and quick response mechanism to the Mission and BDG.
- (b) An assessment of the use of training skills by BDG employees who were trained under the project.

These two foci will be central to the overall evaluation, however, the team can and should examine the project as designed and implemented and provide its views both on the project as a whole and on its various components.

The specific objectives of this evaluation are as follows:

- (a) To provide USAID and BDG with an assessment of the need for and utility of such an umbrella project.
- (b) To determine whether the project has taken up initiatives which were priority and urgent for Bangladesh's development constraints and were at the same time supportive of an efficient portfolio management in the Mission.
- (c) To review the existing design and implementation process for TA activities and sub-projects, and to determine what design and approval standards should be establish to ensure that TRP-II is a quick and flexible mechanism for responding to priority needs.
- (d) To determine the impact of the TRP-II skill training programs on the improvement of BDG efficiency and to provide USAID and BDG with recommendations as to how the training component can be better focused in order to address priority needs and sustain benefits.

Evaluation Issues and Questions

Under the two above mentioned broad areas, the evaluation shall specially examine the constraints which have hindered project implementation and assess the effectiveness of the use of project resources in achieving project objectives.

Focus 1: Usefulness of the TRP-II as a Flexible and Quick Response Mechanism to the Mission and BDG

Question 1: Were the Mission and BDG criteria and procedures for approving sub-projects flexible and quick to respond to priority needs?

Question 2: Given the Mission and BDG criteria and procedures for approving sub-projects flexible and quick to respond to priority needs?

Question 3: Was selection of the sub-projects well focused? Is there a need for more specific guidelines for sharpening project focus in order to establish clarity in the approval process?

Question 4: What role do BDG agencies (ERD, line ministries and Planning Commission) play in the formulation and approval of the sub-project? Is the system currently followed transparent, priority oriented and favorable to "quick responses" to immediate needs?

Question 5: ERD's Americas Branch is a staff unit of the Ministry of Finance. It is the authorized executing agency for TRP-II. Given staff constraint's in this branch and its status in the BDG structure, what is its role in the approval process vis-a-vis other BDG organizations?

Question 6: What specific problems were experienced in the mission and in relevant BDG agencies relating to the Mission and in relevant BDG agencies relating to the formulation and approval of the sub-projects?

Focus 2: Use of Training Skills by BDG Employees Trained under the Project

The evaluations will address the following questions:

Question 1: Have TRP-II supported training programs of 2-20 weeks duration made a difference in the work of BDG professionals (training recipients)? If not, what were the reasons?

Question 2: How are training needs identified by BDG and what role does ERD play in it?

Question 3: Is there enough clarity in the BDG nomination and selection criteria? Is the existing criteria appropriate for selecting the candidates for the right training programs? Do the procedures facilitate quick responses?

Question 4: What are the most critical obstacles in providing training to address a focused development problem? What recommendations can the team make in overcoming these obstacles?

Question 5: How much is the English language proficiency requirement liable to discourage BDG training initiatives?

Question 6: What are the problems Mission experiences in applying the training funds to meet immediate needs?

Statement of Work

The contractor shall develop an appropriate methodology and provide the necessary level of skills and personnel to carry out a mid-term evaluation of TRP-II. This evaluation is to address all of the evaluation issues and questions posed in the preceding sections. The contractor is to provide a written report and oral briefings on the results of the evaluation to both ERD and USAID staffs either jointly or separately as determined during the course of evaluations.

The following is included in the contractor's methodology:

- (a) Review of Project Paper and PP Supplement, project specific Mission Manual Order, Project Agreement and Amendments, and Sub-project evaluations;
- (b) Interviews with TRP-II project Officer in the Program Office, and sub-project officers in the Technical officers.
- (c) Interviews with the office directors and deputy directors of Program Office, Food and Agriculture, Project Development and Engineering Office, Office of Economics and Enterprise, and Chief of the Training Division in the Mission.
- (d) Interviews with the officials at ERD, the Ministry of Establishment, and Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center at Savar, Dhaka.
- (e) Interviews with the selected training participants and their supervisors.

ANNEXURE 3

DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

- (1) Technical Resources II Project (TRP-II) Project Paper, USAID, August 1988.
- (2) Technical Resources II Project (TRP-II) Project Paper Supplement, USAID, July 1992.
- (3) Preliminary Draft of Mission's CDSS, (Under preparation).
- (4) TRP-II Manual Order, USAID, September, 1990.
- (5) TRP-II Project Status Reports, USAID/Dhaka, 1993-1994.
- (6) Public Administration Efficiency Study/USAID/Dhaka, prepared by Checchi and Co.; Consulting Inc. Washington D.C, USA, November 1989.
- (7) Evaluation of the Winrock International Human Resources Development Program in Bangladesh, USAID/ Dhaka, prepared by Development Alternative Inc. Washington D.C, USA, September 1991.
- (8) The Fourth Five Year Plan (1990-1995), Ministry of Planning, Government of Bangladesh, Dhaka, June 1990.
- (9) In-depth Review of Three Women's Programs, prepared by PIACT, Bangladesh with Technical Assistance from CIDA, May 1994.
- (10) Final Report on Export Development Project, USAID/Dhaka, prepared by WPI Inc., Cambridge, MASS, USA, September 1993.
- (11) Report on Public Administration Sector Study in Bangladesh, UNDP/Dhaka, July 1992.
- (12) Final Evaluation of the USAID-funded Export Development Project in BD, prepared by Development Alternative Inc. Washington, D.C September, 1993.
- (13) Employment and small Enterprise Policy in Bangladesh, An Evaluation of HIID/ESEPP Project, USAID/Dhaka, prepared by Steven Haggblade et al, May 1990.
- (14) Dhaka Stock Exchange Project: Final Evaluation, USAID/Dhaka, prepared by Asia Foundation, September 1993.

- (15) Bangladesh Food Policy Project: Final Evaluation, USAID/Dhaka, prepared by Kenneth W.Eubanks and Sadrul A.L.Reza, April 1993.
- (16) Institute of Post-Graduate Studies in Agriculture Project in Bangladesh, USAID/Dhaka, Tripartite Evaluation Report, July 1989.
- (17) AID Conditionalities and Their Impact on Economic Management in Bangladesh, prepared by M. Ali Rashid, USAID/Dhaka, February 1994.
- (18) The BDG Guidelines on Technical Assistance, ERD, Ministry of Finance, May 1992.
- (19) Bangladesh: From Stabilization to Growth, World Bank, March 1994.
- (20) Impact of Private Sector Development on Aid Management in Bangladesh, USAID/Dhaka, prepared by M.H. Khan, February 1994.

ANNEXURE 4

BDG PERSPECTIVE ON TRP-II A SUMMARY OF INTERVIEWS WITH BDG OFFICIALS

BDG Perspective on TRP-II: A Summary of Interviews with BDG Officials

Focus 1: Usefulness of the TRP-II as a Flexible and Quick Response Mechanism to the Mission and BDG

Q1: *Were the Mission and BDG criteria and procedures for approving the sub-projects flexible and quick to respond to priority needs?*

- 1) *"Flexibility" and "Quick response" are normative guidelines, and carry institutional responsibility for their judicious use. And T.A utility is really its ability to plug urgent gaps in the User's capabilities and also help the User to develop his own capacity of sustainability. If "flexibility" or "quick response" are used indiscriminately, it invites adverse criticisms.*
- 2) The initial *relaxed* TRP-II practices also included anticipatory approval by Planning Commission; this tended to become too liberal in its application and created exceptional situations (viz the 1993 FPMU requested 2 studies refusal, or 8 Food Policy extensions, etc).
- 3) The revised *Selection Criteria* has been operating since June,1993. It opts for selection by consensus as against the earlier PIL-driven style, (under which USAID initiated T.As for routine concurrence by ERD). Selection of TRP-II activities now include approved PCP/TAPP in addition to the criteria of time(36 months) and outlay (\$3mn) --- all within the Mission's CDSS goals.
- 4) Decision-making has improved because the present practice of joint choice by ERD and USAID includes joint project-designing with the Users. Since funds for TRP-II are guaranteed, the stage of sourcing Donors is saved; also GOB formalities involving PM/FM are deleted. And although the current system emphasis is fully procedural-oriented, it protects the sub-projects from the problems noticeable in the sub-projects selected informally.

Q2: *Given the Mission's portfolio and priorities, did the Mission efficiently use its management resource in undertaking the sub-projects in the portfolio?*

- 1) USAID applied its guidelines of \$3mn and 36 months which is the cut-off criteria that allows all decisions to be taken at the Mission-level. This enabled "flexibility and quick response" in selecting TRP-II sub-projects.
- 2) Projects are, however, subject to USAID's standard norms so that "flexibility and quick response" appears bounded in procedures.

Q3: *Was selection of the sub-projects well focused? Is there a need for more specific guidelines for sharpening project focus in order to establish clarity in the approval process?*

- 1) FPMU was run for 10 years -- and eventually closed out by USAID 2 years undermines after the time stipulated to BDG. Although this suggests "flexibility", it also cuts across discipline. It is advisable to cast needed elements in a fresh T.A(IFFD) to reduce misuses.
- 2) GOB is establishing national and sectoral priorities; all T.As including TRP-II requests will be to plug resource gaps in this new aid-utilization strategy --- projects will no more be taken in any sector up just because resources are available for it.

Q4: *What role do the BDG agencies (ERD, Line ministries & Planning Commission) play in the formulation and approval of the sub-projects? Is the system currently followed transparent, priority oriented and favourable to "quick responses" to immediate needs?*

- 1) In the current practice, Line Ministry justifies its priority to ERD on the basis of approved TAPP/PCP. ERD prepares working paper for the proposal, and organizes a joint meeting with the Ministry and USAID, normally as a monthly review meeting.
- 2) Current sub-project selection will, therefore, require BDG approval before consideration of the USAID selection criteria in addition to the technical feasibility of the plan and project formalities. This revised arrangement ensures transparent, judicious use of TRP resources albeit grants, for reducing the earlier implementation anomalies of procedural and design weakness.

Q5: *ERD's Americas Branch is a staff unit of the Ministry of Finance. It is the authorized executing agency for TRP-II. Given staff constraint's in this branch and its status in the BDG structure, what is its role in the approval process vis-a-vis other BDG organizations?*

- 1) Proposals are jointly examined by ERD with User Agency/Ministry and USAID for conformity to "BDG approved" and USAID "selection criteria" before formally being requested under TRP-II umbrella. Time taken between receipt of a proposal and PIL is 6-7 months.

- 2) ERD staff were trained in USA under TRP-II on loan negotiations and have acquired competence. However, ERD is not required to examine the technical specifications of the proposals. Normal staff transfer is unavoidable under given administrative system.

Q6: *What specific problems were experienced in the Mission and in relevant BDG agencies relating to the formulation and approval of sub-projects?*

- 1) ERD was overwhelmed by PIL-driven projects without proper study or operating plans. Some of them developed closure-problem(FPMU), User-problem(PIAG) or utilization problem(EPES).
- 2) The major issue that recurs through all TRP Reports, is the poor consolidation of T.A gains due to inappropriate project-closures.

Focus 2: Use of Training Skills by BDG Employees Trained under the Project

Q1: *Have TRP-II supported training programs of 2-20 weeks duration made a difference in the work of BDG professionals (training recipients)? If not, what were the reasons?*

- 1) Short-term Courses include in-country training & overseas study-tours on various subjects, organized in batches of 20 Officers directly by PATC. Where the foreign study tours have lagged, its impact appears depleted due to "loss" of in-country learning. Individual capabilities appear to have been enhanced by exposure to new skills and new methods of work --- where the course durations are short, these benefits are dissolved quickly.
- 2) BPATC prepares Basic-grounding and Course-orientations in close discussion with the Users. Courses have rather high theoretical content due to a gradual depletion of BPATC faculty skills. Lack of continuous development of training faculties affects focus in study-tours as the Trainees are not aware of what to expect.

Q2: *How are training needs identified by BDG and what role does ERD play in it?*

- 1) USAID sends the various array of short-term Overseas Course and schedules to ERD. Establishment Division selects the courses and advises Line Ministries to nominate Trainees for these courses. ERD holds joint meetings with Establishment Division on course selection to satisfy the selection criteria set for TRP-II.

Q3: *Is there enough clarity in the BDG nomination and selection criteria? Are the existing criteria appropriate for selecting the candidates for right training programs? Do the procedures facilitate quick responses?*

- 1) Although there is no bonding of in-country and TRP-II short-term training, all courses are selected in a national HRD approach.

- 2) Formerly, Establishment Division selected trainees but this was time-consuming. Line Ministry now nominates upto D.S-level; J.S and above are cleared by P.M Secretariat. Trainees who meet TRP-II selection criteria, are taken up directly by ERD with USAID.

Q4: *What are the most critical obstacles in providing skill related training for a critical mass of employees to address a focused development problem? What recommendations can the team make in overcoming these obstacles?*

- 1) The major handicaps are poor staffing and poor course designing at BDG training institutions. There is also very little effort to import new skills, particularly information technology(MIS).
- 2) TRP-II should organize (a) foreign training of trainers in modern methods, and (b) training of trainees in computers, policy/system analysis and software to induce necessary mental transformation.
- 3) PATC should be assisted to develop its Faculty within an itemized perspective plan [Faculty members {BMDC (2) Planning Academy (2) and PATC (8) will pursue MS degrees (18 months) under TRP-II].

Q5: *How much is the English language proficiency requirement liable to discourage BDG training initiatives?*

- 1) Line Ministry and Establishment Division are expected to discharge their responsibility to nominate candidates who are "English proficient". USAID puts these candidates to ALI/GU tests and a few are rejected. ERD unsuccessfully negotiated with USAID for waiver of ALI/GU tests.
- 2) Although English proficiency is a necessary condition for foreign course, a strict enforcement may unfortunately disqualify better candidates due to a poorer language command. BIAM is establishing a Language Lab to develop English proficiency of BDG officials.

Q6: *What are the problems Mission experiences in applying the training funds to meet immediate needs?*

- 1) PATC, BMDC & APAD Faculty staff will be sent to USA for training in order to acquire skills in design of new training modules. As there is no instance of default by BDG Trainers (all returned to the country after completing training) so institutional growth and curricula development is expected to stay on course --- it will meet one of Mission's objectives proposed under DMT.

- 2) ERD in its role as Program Manager cannot plan nor initiate new schemes. However, the resulting piece-meal approach to DMT goals precludes an organic institutional growth. BPATC should play a lead role in preparing a comprehensive HRD development plans.
- 3) Mission has not evaluated any DMT activity, and is limited to oral debriefing by the returning trainees. Mission may enhance the training utility by obligating BDG to place specific trainees in related work areas for a specified period of duty.
- 4) DMT inputs were not specified. Mission can assist BPATC growth by intervening on the lines of IPSA to develop specialization through inputting computers, MIS and analytical skills, etc. A computerized tracking system of DMT could focus DMT purposes.
- 5) Mission selects Training Courses and nomination criteria on a yearly basis -- and although this gives better results compared to contractor -managed (WINROCK-HRD) activity, it entails a lot of manpower and supervision. A long-term package or twinning with a single institution abroad could rationalize manpower use and also benefit BDG's personnel development policy.

ANNEXURE 5

LIST OF INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED

BDG

1. Asaf Ud Dowlah
Member, Planning Commission
Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka
2. Dr. Saadat Hossain
Additional Secretary, ERD
Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka
3. Mr. Muhammad Ismail Hossain
Additional Secretary
Ministry of Establishment
Bangladesh Secretariat
4. Mr. Shahidul Alam
Additional Secretary, ERD
Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka
5. Mr. Badiur Rahman
Commissioner, Dhaka Division
Minto Road, Dhaka
6. A.K.M. Azad
Deputy Secretary
Ministry of Establishment
Bangladesh Secretariat
7. Mr. Iqbal Chawdhury
Deputy Secretary, ERD
Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka
8. Aziz-ul-Haq Siddiqui
Deputy Secretary
Technical Assistance, ERD
Sher-e-Bangla Nagar
9. Dr. Zahirul Islam

Course Coordinator
Academy of Planning and Development

LIST OF INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED

Contd...

10. Mrs. Shirin Rahman
Additional Director
Directorate of Women's Affairs
11. Mrs. Nilufar Zahan
Asstt. Chief, Planning Cell
Ministry of Agriculture
Bangladesh Secretariat
12. Mr. Shahid Ullah
Sr. Asstt. Secretary
ERD
13. Mr. Moazzem Hossain Miah
Member, Directing Staff (Project)
Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center
14. Mr. Auribindo Kar
Director (Programming, Planning & Records)
Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center
15. Mr. A.K. Fazlul Haque
Director (Publication)
Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center
16. Mr. Kazi Aminul Islam
Deputy Director (Regional Center)
Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center
17. Mr. Musharraf Hossain Bhuiyan
Deputy Director (Administration)
Bangladesh Public Administration Training Center

USAID

18. BROWN, Richard M.

Mission Director

19. YOUNG Frank J.
Deputy Mission Director

LIST OF INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED

Contd...

20. SCHWARTZ, Karl
Program Officer
Office of Program
21. JAN ROCKLIFFE, King
Evaluation Specialist
Office of Program
22. Al-Muti, Syed
Project Manager
Office of Program
23. Siddiqui, Mujib
Training Specialist
Training Division
24. Sulaiman Riffat
Training Specialist
Training Division
25. Ahmed, Zia U
Project Coordinator
Office of Economics & Enterprise
26. Rashid, Raka
WID Specialist
Office of Economics & Enterprise
27. Rahman, Habibur
Program Specialist
Agriculture Development Division
28. Rahman, Latifur
Program Specialist
Agriculture Development Division

29. Khalil, Ibrahim
Project Management Specialist
Agriculture & Food Policy Division

LIST OF INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED

Contd...

Others

30. Rini Reza
Program Officer
UNDP

31. Dr. Shamsuddin
Program Officer
World Bank, Dhaka

32. Ismet Zerín Khan
Deputy Director
Belia, Road # 7
Dhanmondi, Dhaka

ANNEXURE 6

LIST OF THE PARTICIPANTS

Name	Organization & Address	Field of Training	Duration weeks	Institution
Mrs. Sultana Akbar	Deputy Director 37/Eskaton Garden Rd. Directorate of Women Affairs	Administration	5	International Institute of Development/USDA
Mrs. Zinat Ara	Judge Court Add. Dist & Sessions Judge	Administration	2	Harvard Law School
Gulnar Nazmun Nahar	Asst. Secretary Ministry of Edu. Bhaban-6, Room-1812	Administration	5	International Institute of Development/USDA
Mr. Iqbal Chowdhury	Deputy Secretary ERD	Finance	4	International Law Institute
Syed Ataur Rahman	Sr. Asstt. Secretary Ministry of Fisheries & Live stock Bangladesh Secretariat	Admin	5	USDA Graduate School
Siddique Hossain Chowdhury	Joint Commissioner Taxes NBR Segun Bagicha, 2nd 12 storied Building, 5th Floor	Tax	4	Institute for Tax Administration
Tarek Mostafa Ali	Additional Director NBR Segun Bagicha, 2nd 12 storied Building, 5th Floor	Tax	4	Institute for Tax Administration
Hafizia Khatun	Assistant Chief Planning Commission House-1, Room-6 Shera Bangla Nagar Dhaka.	Business	18	New Hampshire College
Mr. Obaidul Kadir	SPARSO Shera Bangla Nagar Dhaka.	Others	6	Tailored Training Program, NASA, USA.
Mr. Raquib Azam	SSO SPARSO Shera Bangla Nagar, Dhaka.	Others	8	Tailored Training Program, NASA, USA.
Mrs. Mehrun Nessa	SPARSO Shera Bangla Nagar Dhaka.	Others	6	Tailored Training Program, NASA, USA.
Dr. Jinnahtul Islam	PSO SPARSO Shera Bangla Nagar, Dhaka.	Others	6	Tailored Training Program, NASA, USA.
Mr. Fazlul Haque	SSO SPARSO Shera Bangla Nagar, Dhaka.	Others	9	Tailored Training Program, NASA, USA.
Mr. Motiur Rahman	Deputy Secretary Min of Agriculture Bld.-4, Room-419	Administration	5	International Law Institute
A.M.M. Azhar	Assistant Secretary Min of Agriculture Bld.-4, Room-419	Administration	5	International Law Institute

Name	Organization & Address	Field of Training	Duration weeks	Institution
Mizunur Rahman	Manager Export Credit Guarantee Department, Shadaran Bima Corporation, Dilkusha, C/A	Finance	2 to 3	Tailored Training Program, India/Malaysia/Indonesia
Mr. Lutfar Rahman	General Manager Export Credit Guarantee Department, Shadaran Bima Corporation, Dilkusha, C/A	Finance	2 to 3	Tailored Training Program, India/Malaysia/Indonesia
Mr. Jashim Uddin	Manager Export Credit Guarantee Department, Shadaran Bima Corporation, Dilkusha, C/A	Finance	2 to 3	Tailored Training Program, India/Malaysia/Indonesia

ANNEXURE 6

SELF ASSESSMENT (Case Studies)

Case Study No 1

BDG/Affiliation : Directorate of Women's Affairs
Course : Management Roles for Women in Development
Duration : 5 weeks
Institution : USDA Graduate School

1. I think that it takes some time to adjust to the local environment and conditions after coming back from the training overseas and to apply acquired skills.
2. The problems in my own experience, is that I am very much preoccupied with too many responsibilities delegated from the top which hardly allows time to concentrate on change and better management.
3. I acknowledge that my overseas training has provided valuable exposure and helped me to broaden my mental horizon. Upon return from training, I designed a project for "income generating activities for women" which was eventually funded by a Donor. I arranged 3 workshops in project planning and implementation for colleagues.
4. The training helped me to learn some new skills, build confidence and establish professional contacts with several development Organization in the US.
5. Regarding difficulties encountered, detailed information prior to training was not given. The courses comprised of too many topics within limited time. There was limited time to devote to library and computer learning. There was some inconsistencies in per diem amount and the amount was reduced and not sufficient.
6. I would suggest that continuity in the same job is essential to make contribution after the training.
7. Selection must be made on the basis of merit (right person for right of training). Better design of courses is needed to optimize cross cultural benefits and comparative aspects of learning that were provided through my overseas training.

Case Study No. 2

BDG/Affiliation : Ministry of Law & Justice
Course : Instruction for Lawyers
Duration : 2 weeks
Institution : Harvard Law College

1. The two week course at Harvard was a tremendous experience for me both personally and professionally. The course was well focused but too much was concentrated in too little time. It was quite demanding. The duration of the course was too limited.
2. As a result of the training, I felt more confident in interpreting the law correctly and in using my new skills in writing decisions. The training had a clear motivational impact. After the return I revised and published three articles on Bonded Child Labor, Women and Labor Law, and Social Security in Asian context.
3. The training encouraged me to make and maintain professional contacts with ILO and other international Organizations.
4. As a result of the training, I felt an urgent necessity to enhance the professional quality in the judicial sector. I felt that the outlook and the practice in this sector are traditional and primitive. In fact, officers in this sector are rarely sent for overseas training. Correct decisions and good judgement can not be undertaken by many officers for lack of exposure and good training.
5. I recommend that it is necessary to build in-country training facilities. I also recommend that Officers in the Government who work in the Government and are over 50 years should not be sent for overseas training. I believe older officers are experienced but very resistant to change. Additionally, women should be given preference for training, especially female lawyers, teachers, bankers etc.
6. The skills learnt are still beneficial to me in my work. However the lack of facilities, and qualified staff, and general local conditions make it difficult to put the learning to practice.

Case Study No. 3

BDG/Affiliation : National Board of Revenue (NBR) Ministry of Finance
Course : Public Taxation Policy
Duration : 4 weeks
Institution : Institute for Tax Administration

1. I attended a five week training course in taxation in the US. I was impressed by the quality of training. It was very beneficial to me at a personal level. I was exposed to new subject matter and modernized systems and procedures. However, upon my return, I realized that I could not introduce a meaningful change in my Organization. Overseas training does provide intellectual stimulus and an exposure to other cultures and environment. But the needs of organizational development vary from one organization to other. It seems that need based courses designed and implemented in the country and within job context would be more relevant.
2. The structure of organization by itself leaves no scope for change. So in terms of my training, the benefits to the organization are insignificant. I think computer-related training could be better done in the home country. Tailor made training facilities delivered by quality faculty is an urgent need to train professionals in my organization. Computerization is an urgent requirement on the part of all facets of this Organization.
3. I and others trained have not been able to share our knowledge with out colleagues. The local system, practices, and environment are extremely different and overseas training to employees of this Organization did not seem to benefit the organization.

Case Study No. 4**

BDG/Affiliation : Ministry of Agriculture
Course : Principles of Management and Information System (MIS)
Duration : 5 weeks
Institution : USDA Graduate School

1. It was amazing to be exposed to the application of computers to a variety of planning and information management systems. Our training was specifically in MIS and since we did not have any previous background in the field, I felt handicapped.
2. We suggested that training of this kind could be arranged very well by AIT (Asian Institute of Technology) Thailand, or institutions in India or Malaysia where more people could be trained within the same budget. Training in these countries would be more compatible to Bangladesh situation because of the proximity of institutions, culture, and many other similarities.
3. We believe that computer application within Government will help in expediting work process and could have positive impact on reducing corruption. Selection of candidates is not properly done and there is limited match in the skill requirements and overseas training. For example, we were trained in MIS, but we can not apply this to our ministry. There are few computers and even those are not properly utilized.

** Joint interview with 2 Officers attending the same program.

Case Study No. 5^{***}

BDG/Affiliation : Space & Atmospheric Research Organization (SPARSO)
Course : Tailored Training Program
Duration : 6 weeks/ 8 weeks/ 9 weeks
Institution : NASA & others

1. SPARSO is a technology and knowledge-based autonomous organization directly concerned with weather forecasting, cyclone warning, and metrology. In SPARSO, interaction of man and machine is necessary to produce reliable results. SPARSO is suffering immensely with shortage of equipments and needed repair of many existing electronic equipments. So productivity and output optimization is being greatly hampered. Training had an impact upon the enhancement of our professional skills and capabilities. However, a number of the trainees from SPARSO have left the job after training for better job opportunities elsewhere.
2. They Group expressed reservations about the short duration of the training which failed to cover all aspects of their work. The sponsoring agency failed to arrange many things efficiently. NASA as the training Organization, should have been involved in taking the responsibility of such specialized scientific training program. The Group indicated that due to English test by USAID, many deserving candidates could not be selected for training. They suggest that requirements of English test should be examined in advance before candidates are nominated and selected.
3. The problem of retention of staff in the Organization is serious due to lack of competitive salaries and incentives. This combined with the lack of proper equipment and qualified staff make it difficult to apply the technical skills acquired.

^{***} Joint interview with 5 Officers under the same training program.

ANNEXURE 7

ACTION PLAN

1.1 The Action Plan given below proposes an exercise in pragmatism: there can be no good plan if it cannot be implemented, and there can be no good implementation if it is not orderly planned out.

1.2 We have already given the rationale behind the selection of BPATC, BIAM, Womens Affairs Deptt (WAD) and ERD's MIS. They have the added advantages of qualifying for TRP-II (please see TRP-II LogFrame). However, the Logframe has not defined the Qualitative changes that can be expected from a well-designed TA. A normative design- matrix for TA planning by Goals/Indicators/Changes is set out below. It can make the TRP-II sub-project designing more specified, which in turn means better operations control:

Elements	Project Goals	Verifiable Indicators	Validators
1. Tech.Assistance	QUICK response <u>FLEXIBILITY</u>	Socio-economic growth Policy-making Project-level O&M	<u>TAs Impact</u> Capacity change Employment
2. Skill transfer	<u>INDIVIDUAL</u> skills <u>ORGANIZATION</u> pool	Options analysis Productivity/Utilisn Professionalism	<u>Selection</u> Output/Quality Competence
3. Commodities(ERD)not within purview.....			
4. Development Study and Analysis	<u>MANAGEMENT</u> skills <u>INSTITUTIONAL</u>	Evaluation process Planning capability Research capacity	<u>Managerial</u> Analysis Designing
5. Project Design & Evaluation	<u>TECHNICAL</u> skills <u>MONITOR</u> capability	Data/Impact mapping MIS operations Better processes	<u>Operation</u> Line tasks Efficiency
6. Auditnot within purview.....			
7. Women in Development	<u>DIRECT</u> benefits <u>GENDER</u> gains	Opportunities Skill formation Job/Market participation	<u>Training</u> Training Opportunity
8. Development Management Training	<u>NONPROJECT</u> skills O&M Methods Human Resources Dev	Administration/Management Technical quality Managerial	<u>Efficacy</u> Planning
9. Unrelated TAs	<u>TECHNOLOGY</u> gain SOFTWARE/ HARDWARE	Efficiency Operations capacity Management capability	<u>Profits</u> Growth Income

1.3 We set out in the pages below, an indicative Activity Chart to implement the 4 sub-projects recommended above: it incorporates the TA-design matrix to DEMONSTRATE the use of such tools:

ACTIVITY CHART

Activity Element	Strengthening BPATC		Developing BIAM		Developing Women's Affairs Dept.		Developing ERD's MIS	
	Role of BDG	Role of USAID	Role of BDG	Role of USAID	Role of BDG	Role of USAID	Role of BDG	Role of USAID
1. Budget	Dev. Budget	\$3,300,000	Dev. Budget	\$3,000,000	Dev. Budget	\$1,700,000	Dev. Budget	\$300,000
2. TA Development - Goal - Strategy - Activity time	Proposal Design: Flexibility HRD planning 2 months	Evaluation: Capacity change DMT component	Proposal Design: Quick response Private initiative 3 months	Evaluation: New capacity Strengthen DMT	Proposal Design: Socio-econ. gain Project-level O&M 2 months	Evaluation: Capacity change Poverty alleviation	Proposal Design: Quick response Policy making 2 months	Evaluation: Capacity change Project O&M
3. Skill transfer - Individual - Organizational - Activity time	Output aimed: Training linkage to career dev. Improved utilisen. 3 months	Monitor following: Guarantee posting for fixed period MIS in practice	Output aimed: OJT learning Advisory to BDG 3 months	Monitor following: Faculty support Twinning with US training institution	Output aimed: Professionalism More output and better quality 4 months	Monitor following: Competence growth Higher system productivity	Output aimed: Professionalism Improved output 2 months	Monitor following: Competence growth Better operation
4. Development analysis - Management - Institutional - Activity time	Itemize following: Dsgn policy papers More productivity 3 months	Inputs needed: Evaluation support Newer designs	Itemize following: Research & design Planning capability 6 month	Inputs needed: Course designing Analytical tools	Itemize following:	Inputs needed:	Itemize following: Evaluation process Planning capability 2 month	Inputs needed: Analytical training Design systems
5. Project Design - Technical skill - Monitoring capability - Activity time	Sustain gains: Data mapping Operational R&D 3 months	Inputs needed: Modern analysis O&M Methodology	Sustain gains: Evaluation skills MIS skills 4 months	Inputs needed: Modern Methodology CPM models	Sustain gains: Better processes MIS operations 6 months	Inputs needed: Overseas courses Operations support	Sustain gains: Data bank MIS operations 3 months	Inputs needed: Training Modern Methodology
6. Women in development - Direct benefits - Gender gains - Activity time	Action needed: Line tasks Employment 6 months	Inputs needed: Formative training Leadership role	Action needed: Opportunity role Skills formation 4 months	Inputs needed: Higher training Participation	Action needed: Job opportunity Market participation 12 months	Inputs needed: Training Opportunity support	Action needed:	Inputs needed:
7. DMT component - Non-project skills - O&M methods - Activity time	Institutionalize: Modern systems Technical skills 18 months	Inputs needed: Training of Trainers New methodologies	Institutionalize: Training of Trainers HRD planning 15 months	Inputs needed: Higher training English language Training	Institutionalize: Technical skills HRD programs 6 months	Inputs needed: Foreign training Planning support	Institutionalize: Technical skills Modern systems 3 months	Inputs needed: Foreign training Planning support
8. Unrelated TA gains - Technology&Hardware - Software/Expertise - Activity time	Monitor results: Operatn capability Custom designing 1 month	Inputs needed: Computer/Hardware Software/Expertise	Monitor results: Efficiency O&M operations 1 month	Inputs needed: Computer & Hardware Software/Expertise	Monitor results: Operation Capacity Management capability 2 months	Inputs needed: Computer & Hardware Expertise	Monitor results: Efficiency Management capability 2 months	Inputs needed: Computer Networking Software & Expertise
End of Cycle	36 months	\$3,300,000	36 months	\$3,000,000	32 months	\$1,700,000	12 months	\$300,000

ANNEXURE 8

BANGLADESH INSTITUTE OF ADM MANAGEMENT

1. Bangladesh Institute for Administrative Management (BIAM) was established in 1992 by the BCS Officers Welfare Association. It addresses the skill development needs of BDG officials.
2. BCS (Admin) cadre, including the erstwhile Secretariat service, has a current strength of 4000 Members. It forms the core of the bureaucracy, as is shown below:
 - (a) Of 5 Members in Planning Commission, 4 are from BCS (Admin).
 - (b) Of the 52 Secretaries to the GOB, 42 are from BCS (Admin).
 - (c) All 64 Districts and 464 Thanas of the country including their Law, Land & Finance office, are run by BCS (Admin).
 - (d) The major Corporations and Parastatal Agencies are managed by Officers from BCS (Admin).
3. Currently, members of the erstwhile Central Services of the Pakistan give leadership to the BCS (Admin). But in view of their prospective retirement around 2000 AD and the large number of untrained Officers who will take over the reins of administration, a massive Training Program is now presenting itself as the "a priori" condition for developing the country.
4. The existing public-sector Training institution (particularly PATC, Planning Academy and GOTA under Establishment Division) appear inadequate and also incapable for imparting functional training to raise the managerial and policy-making skills of these officers. This is explained below:
 - (a) PATC despite its excellent infrastructure at Savar, is faced with depletion of qualitative Faculty members (no Ph.Ds as against 8 Ph.Ds in 1980); and its lecture-style teaching has very little problem researched content.
 - (b) Planning Academy is currently focussed upon providing "Basic foundation" training to new Entrants and is moving from training in the planning disciplines. It also suffers from depletion of Faculty skills.
 - (c) GOTA is oriented for new Entrants and lacks both skills and mandate to train mid-level Officers. Furthermore, it is affected by transferrable jobs of the Faculty.
5. Foreign training, currently at the rate of say 50 Officers annually, is both cost-inhibited and time-barred proposition for resolving the emerging training crisis.

6. Under these circumstances, BIAM has been taken up as a timely input to correct the failure of BDG in properly planning for the HRD sector in its policy-making exercises. BIAM is now a development project under Establishment Division for purposes of implementation.
7. It is being built on 1.5 acres of own land with a budget of Tk. 10 crores (1993-96). At the end of this development, it will comprise of
 - ! a fully equipped Training Center, complete with Library, Documentation Center, Conference facility and Hostel for inhouse trainees;
 - ! a commercial building to support its operations on purely self-financed basis.
8. BIAM advocates a multi-disciplinary approach to HRD with focus on "efficiency" and "efficacy"
 - ! create an enabling environment to build-up managerial and analytical skills in 2500 Junior Officers in 10 years;
 - ! use Senior Officers and Professionals in seminar-style training tailored to transfer experience and knowledge through participatory learning.
9. BIAM's will focus upon the following "primary" skill needs:
 - (a) Public Administration
 - ! Development Management
 - ! Project Administration
 - (b) Economic Administration
 - ! Project Negotiating Skills
 - ! MIS and CPM Techniques
 - ! Broad-based Economic and Social Specialisation
 - (c) Policy-making
 - ! Project Designing Skills
 - ! Analytical Tools
 - ! Computer Literacy
 - (d) Personality Development
 - ! Career Counselling
 - ! Group Action
 - (e) Others
 - ! Language Training
 - ! Overseas Exposures
 - ! Twinning Program and Overseas Experts
 - ! Inhouse Professional Consulting Services

10. From a development perspective, BIAM inculcates the following advantages for quicker development of a neglected HRD sector:

- ! it will use private sector initiative and efficiency for an urgent "HRD in Public Administration" program;
- ! it advocates reform in the future administrative styles by addressing cross-sectoral management skill needs;
- ! it targets quality as the Professional Associations for Doctors, Teachers, etc offer no management-orientation;
- ! it posits a far more responsive administration through emphasis on efficiency, modern methods and moral needs.

Extract from BIAM PCP

1. Project : BD Institute of Administration & Management
2. Exec Agency : Establishment Division
BD Civil Service (Admin) Association
3. Purpose : BIAM is set up to promote HRD in administration:
 - a) to give training to BDG manpower engaged in development administration;
 - b) to train unemployed youth for development and administrative roles;
 - c) to conduct research in adminstrn & management;
 - d) to advise BDG on administn/development issues;
 - e) to introduce modern skills in development administration, planning and management.
4. Conformity to FFYP : The primary focus of FFYP is HRD and employment-generation for promoting development. Work cannot be conducted without skilled manpower.

BIAM will not only train members of BCS(Admin), but will also offer orientation training to other service and professional groups. This serves the FFYP purposes.
7. Project :
 - a) Institutional: BIAM will train both administrative benefitsofficials and members of other cadres and professional groups;
 - b) Productivity: BIAM will raise administrative and managerial competence of BDG;
 - c) WID: BIAM will have special training for leadership development of women;
 - d) Environment: BIAM will introduce ecology-linkedplanning concepts in BDG.
8. Other
 - a) BIAM will supplement the tasks of BCS (Civil) Academy issuesand BPATC. The above 2 institutions now provide administrative training to BDG officers only, but BIAM will give development management and technical analysis skills to both BDG officials and unemployed youth for raising the human resources of the country for a broader development participation. This will entail lower expenditure than can be attained by BDG. Furthermore, BPATC and BCS Academy fail to provide adequate training in time; BIAM will supplement the needs of these 2 organisations.
 - b) BIAM will focus upon development management. BPATC and BCS Academy focus on Foundation Course and Judicial training. BIAM will offer training in development administration, poverty alleviation, mass communication, HRD, disaster management, environment protection, ethics and values, personnel development and counselling, moral development, project management, analytical technics, language training, computers.

- c) BIAM will organise national and international seminars and workshops. BIAM will aid idea-flows with WB, UNDP, ILO, WHO, and other Donors through various regional and national Seminars.

ANNEXURE 9

DIRECTORATE OF WOMEN'S AFFAIRS

1. Socio-economic development cannot be made broad-based without participation of the women's community which has been hitherto neglected. BDG is placing emphasis on Women's Development. BDG has opened the scope for women's participation in economically gainful activities. A separate Ministry for Women's Affairs now looks after gender needs exclusively. This change in policy is a major step in social mobilization of women and welfare.
2. In pursuance of this policy, BDG developed programmes for functional literacy, vocational training, health, nutrition, family planning, and income-generation activities for the family-economy, and improving the physical qualities of life. This packaged programme is intended to serve as a vehicle for greater social mobility and participation of women at all levels. The change in Government attitude thus emanates from its firm belief that women's participation in economic life can lead to a rise in family income and enhance their decision-making in family matters such as domestic budgets, family size, children's education, marriages etc.
3. Besides the regular BDG programmes, voluntary organizations, both locally financed and externally aided, are active in women's social mobilization to raise their social status, or increase their political consciousness and create educational and employment opportunities. Majority of these organizations attempt to organize women into a cohesive social groups, and to impart vocational training to them.
4. Although programing women's activities has progressively increased in both the public and private sectors, there are constraining social and economic factors. A variety of these programmes, with training components, are scattered in both rural and urban areas with little information available. Nor were any serious attempts to prepare a consolidated data. Few studies were made in the past to find out the underlying causes of women's backwardness and exploitation. But these studies did not enquire into the details of the causes which hindered the 'women in development' activities as well as the organizational behavior affecting their implementation.
5. In an attempt to overcome these shortcomings, a study was prepared to make an inventory with a brief analysis of the organizations by sponsorship, objectives and contents. This "Inventory for Women's Organizations in Bangladesh" was jointly sponsored in 1981 by the Women's Development Unit of UNICEF and Women's Affairs Sector of Planning Commission to collect information on registered Women's Development programs and specifically those oriented to women with special focus on income-earning activities. The focus was two-fold: to spread the much needed information among diverse clientele, and to provide an overall view of the state of affairs regarding women's organizations for better information-based plans.

6. The objectives of this study were :
 - (a) To identify
 - i) specific development programmes with special emphasis on income-earning projects;
 - ii) projects of various ministries/autonomous bodies that intend to promote the scope for female participation (Annexure A) and to enlist these programmes/projects by functional categories.
 - (b) To collect information about their affiliation and sources of financing.
 - (c) To gather information about the nature and type of activities and their efforts for social mobilization and creating economic activities.
 - (d) To collect relevant information about their current activities and to know their future course of action.
7. Thus the major problem in WID programs that ability to identify good organizations, delineate their objectives, and specify their functions has already been accomplished. This inventory can guide future action by the interested agencies.
8. Many of organizations are currently engaged in a variety of development-oriented activities and each organization is doing more than one activities simultaneously. Data show that sewing is the most common function (24.2%) followed by adult literacy (17.4%), child care and family planning (14.5%), and jute and bamboo works with other development works (13.0%).
9. The rationale for selecting specific skills in the training programmes show that economic benefit and demand for goods, availability of raw materials, trainers availability and the trainees' interest determine the selected training programmes. Two factors, trainees' interest and expected economic gains, appear to be the underlying considerations in such programmes.

However, multiplicity of organizational objectives disperses attention and effort in attaining the goals. It is necessary to assist these voluntary organizations to maximize their efforts within the given constraints.

10. Women's Affairs Department should take up specific management programmes to either assist these various organizations to confine themselves to fewer objectives, or to priorities the objectives and organize their course of action accordingly. This should be packaged with better artisanship by obtaining necessary expertise and cooperation with regional countries. O&M training offered to these organizations could also obtain better supervised programmes and more focussed results.

ABU YOUSUF ABDULLAH

ADDRESS

Institute of Business Administration (IBA)
University of Dhaka, Dhaka-1000, Bangladesh.
Phone : 507050/1 Fax : 880-2-883341

DATE OF BIRTH

December 1, 1984, Bangladesh

PRESENT OCCUPATION

Lecturer, IBA, University of Dhaka

PRESENT RESPONSIBILITIES

- i) Chair person, Area of Marketing Management, IBA, University of Dhaka.
- ii) Executive Director, Synergy Group (a leading consulting firm for quality research).

AREA OF INTEREST

Role of Group Entrepreneurship Development in Bangladesh and its competitiveness for export market.

Corporate Policy Making and Strategic Analysis of Business Unit.

Development of competitive strategy and promotional activities in Business Organization.

EDUCATION

MBA, 1992. Helsinki School of Economics and Business Administration, Finland.

Major: International Business

Foreign Study under exchange program at the University of Texas at Austin, U.S.A.

MBA, December 1989, Institute of Business Administration, University of Dhaka.

Major: Marketing

Bachelor (Social Science), 1988, University of Dhaka.

WORKING EXPERIENCE AND TRAINING

- i) Workshop & Training on "Case Teaching" conducted by Association of Management Development 1994. Dhaka, Bangladesh.

- ii) Workshop & Training on "Case Writing" conducted by UNDP/ITC and EPS.
- iii) Conducted a workshop on Entrepreneurship Development for trainers and entrepreneurs. April 17-22, 1993, IBA, University of Dhaka.
- iv) Participated in the workshop on the "Total Quality Management (TQM)" at the University of Texas at Austin, U.S.A., June 1992 - August 1992.
- v) Strategic Marketing Analyst, Flexibrite Ltd., Helsinki, Finland. December 1990 - July 1992.
- vi) Financial Analyst, All-Baraka Bank Bangladesh Ltd., Financial Analysis and project evaluation. December 1989 - April 1990.
- vii) Internship Training in GEC Bangladesh Ltd., August 1988 - December 1989.

MAJOR CONSULTING

- i) Organizational strengthening and Marketing Strategy Development for East West Property Development Ltd. October 93 - December 93.
- ii) Developing a penetration strategy for Garments Accessories and machineries in Bangladeshi market, sponsored by "Impex Korea Ltd." June 1993 - August 1993.
- iii) Overall strategies to increase occupancy rate of Hotel Sundarban for the non-transit passengers, sponsored by "Hotel Sundarban"., January 1993 - February 1993.
- iv) Consultant of "Balancing Modernization Rehabilitation Extension (BMRE) Project",

sponsored by Dhaka Hides & Skins Ltd.,
October 1992 - January 1993.

HONORS

- i) Honored with "Finnish Govt. Scholarship" to study in the U.S.A.
- ii) Placed in the merit list in the Matriculation exam. in 1980, Jessore Board, Bangladesh.
- iii) "College Blue" & Best all round cadet, 1982, Jhenidah Cadet College.

ACTIVITIES

- i) Member, Academic Committee of MBA Program, IBA.
- ii) Member, Research & Scholarship Committee, IBA.
- iii) Member, Women Development Management Committees, IBA, Dhaka University
- iv) President, Bangladesh Association of Finland, May 1992 - December 1992, Helsinki, Finland.
- v) Member MBA Alumni Club, Helsinki, Finland.
- vi) Travelled extensively in Europe, the U.S.A. and South Asian countries.

LANGUAGES

Bengali - Mother tongue, English - Excellent Hindi - Good (spoken), Finnish - Good (Spoken)

REFERENCE

Available upon request

Personal

Name: NASSER AHMAD
Father's Name: Mohsenuddin Ahmad (Late)
Date of Birth: 3 June, 1945
Address:

Education

1967 1st Class, M.Sc. in Physics, Dhaka University
1966 1st Class, B.Sc. (Hons) Physics, Dhaka University
1961 1st Class, Matriculation, Dhaka Board

Professional:

To date Investment Consultant
BMRE of Sick Industrial Units under Bangladesh Shilpa Rin Sangstha

1991-89 MIS Consultant for Ford Foundation
Establishment of Textile Sector Data-bank, 1971-90
Ministry of Textile

1987-85 Management Consultant to BPMI
Evaluation of Technical Aid to Bangladesh, 1972-85, ERD

1985-84 Management Consultant to BPMI
Evaluation of Women's Employment
Ministry of Social Welfare

1984-82 Management Consultant to ILO
Evaluation of Productivity Centre in Bangladesh

1982-81 Investment Consultant
Techno Economic Feasibility Plan of Jamuna Bridge
Ministry of Communications

1981-80 Deputy Secretary
Inspection Monitoring & Evaluation Division
Ministry of Planning

1980-79 Deputy Secretary
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

1979-76 First Secretary

Bangladesh Embassy
GDR and Czechoslovakia

1976-73 Assistant Secretary
International Economic Affairs
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

1970 Civil Service of Pakistan
(First from East Pakistan)

1969-68 System Analyst
International Computers Ltd
United Kingdom

Training:

a. Domestic 1966-67
Low Energy (Proton-Gamma) Reaction Studies Pakistan
Atomic Energy Commission, Dhaka
Dhaka University

1970-71
Development Administration & Diplomacy
Civil Service Training Academy, Lahore
Government of Pakistan

b. Foreign 1971-73
Language Course
Government of Japan

1977-80
Ph.D. Dissertation
"Employment Planning by Spatial Programming BD"
Technical University, Germany

1969-70
Advanced Computer Management
International Computers, Ltd., UK

Specializations:

Low Energy (P.Y) Reaction of Particles, 1967, as
Dissertation for M.Sc. from Dhaka University

Computerized MIS system, 1980, operating under
IMED/Planning, Ministry of GOB

Employment Planning by Spatial Programming in BD,
unpublished due to GOB restriction on travel abroad

Conceptual Design of Jamuna Multi-Purpose Bridge, 1987,
adopted by M/o Roads & Communication

MIS Data-bank on Textile Sector, 1991, operating under
M/o Textiles

Masjid-based Human Resources Development, 1993, NGO
Financing Document under submission to IDB/Jeddah

Investment Programming of Sick Industries under submission
to BSRS

Cultural:

Executive Director
BD Institute for Habitat Development (BIHD)
(dedicated to developing Rural Employment)

Planning Advisor
Association of Muslim Welfare Agencies of BD (AMWAB)
- (dedicated to developing Rural Employment)

Chairman
Mohsen Development Trust
(dedicated to social philanthropy)

RASHID S. AHMAD

Permanent US Contact

C/o Dickinson Miller
1635 Irving Street, N.W., Apartment #3
Washington, D.C. 20010
Tel: 202-332-4122
Fax: 301-588-2864

Permanent Karachi Contact

World Bank Projects Office
32-D/1, Block 6, P.E.C.H.S, P.O. Box 12579
Karachi, Pakistan
Tel (Off) : 92-21-437107/454-6988
Tel (Res) : 533588
Fax: 92-21-454-8188

Summary

Mr. Ahmad has over twenty years of experience in design, appraisal, implementation, and evaluation of economic and social development projects in developing countries. He specializes in *institution building, management development and training, community and social development, and public policy*. Mr. Ahmad has held senior technical and managerial positions in projects supported by multilateral and bilateral donor agencies in *Pakistan, Bangladesh, Nepal, Indonesia, Egypt, Jordan, the occupied territories, and Nigeria*. *Administrative and regulatory policy development and institutional and management development* pertaining to *investment planning and budgeting, taxation, transport, environment and resettlement, education, and agriculture* have been the main focus of his work in these countries. Design and implementation of training programs for management improvements in government and non-government sector organizations constitutes a significant portion of Mr. Ahmad's experience. This broad range of experience is complemented by his methodological skills and ability to address strategic issues in project management, promote client/beneficiary participation and commitment through process facilitation, and effectively participate in and lead multi-disciplinary teams.

Education

1977 Ph.D., Public Administration, University of Hawaii
1972 M.A., Public Policy, University of Hawaii
1967 M.A., International Affairs, University of Sindh, Pakistan.
1965 B.A., Economics, University of Sindh, Pakistan.

Languages

Good skills in Arabic, fluent in Urdu, Hindi and Sindhi

Personal

Single; U.S. Citizen; Born 1, 1947

Professional Experience

Jan 1991 - Present Institutional Development Specialist World Bank/Pakistan

Primarily responsible for assisting in the design and supervision of policy and institutional development components of Sindh Special Development Project which links physical investments in urban sector with policy and institutional reform to enable the provincial government strengthen investment planning and financing and rationalize expenditures; decentralize infrastructure planning and tax collection to local governments; adopt regulatory policies in urban sector; and increase private sector participation in the provision of basic services through deregulation. Directly work with senior officials of core government departments, Karachi Development Authority, Karachi Water and Sewerage Board, Karachi Municipal Corporation, and municipal bodies in the interior to facilitate changes in the existing legal, administrative, and financial systems and procedures and design supportive policy, institutional development, and training measures. Select and facilitate work of consultants and ensure consistency across project components.

Nov 1990 - Jan 1991 Training Specialist UNDP/ADB, Nepal

Conducted an assessment of training requirements in key ministries for adopting an Integrated Program Planning and Budgeting System in the Government of Nepal. Designed a plan for in-country and foreign training.

Jun - Oct 1990 Education Planning & Finance Specialist USAID/Pakistan

Carried out a study of private primary and secondary education in the four provinces of Pakistan based on empirical and qualitative assessment of academic and financial characteristics of 500 schools. Analyzed major issues in private education relating to quality, affordability, financing, and management. Developed recommendations and operational measures to mobilize increased participation of private sector in education. As a result of the study, the government established private education foundations in Sindh and Punjab.

May - Jun 1990 Organizational Development Specialist USAID/Indonesia

Conducted an evaluation of the General Participant Training Project with special focus on the quality and relevance of training, participant selection process, and utilization of trained personnel.

May - Nov 1989 Secretariat System Specialist USAID/Bangladesh

Carried out an in-depth assessment of constraints to administrative efficiency in seven key ministries of the Government of Bangladesh. Developed operational plans to improve decision-making procedures, work methods, inter-departmental coordination, record-keeping, personnel management, and training capabilities.

Feb - Apr 1989 Institutional Development Specialist
Agriculture Sector Analysis, USAID/Bangladesh

Conducted an assessment of major public and private sector institutions and NGOs and their performance in agricultural production. Identified institutional constraints to agricultural productivity as related to farmers' access to land, institutional credit, and other essential inputs. Developed program strategies and investment options for training, education and research, and for improving implementation capacity at local levels through collaboration among public, private, and non-governmental organizations.

Dec 1988 - Feb 1989 Management Analyst
USAID/West Bank & Gaza Working Group

Evaluated USAID funded NGO Program in Community Development in the West Bank and Gaza Strip to determine impacts of the projects on rural income, health, education, and water and sanitation in approximately 100 communities.

1987 - 1988 Assistant Director, Multicultural Career Internship Program
Washington, D.C

Designed and supervised educational, vocational, and income generation training projects for low-income immigrant minority youth and adults from Asia, Africa, and Latin America with special focus on increasing female access to education and employment.

Mar - May 1987 Organizational Development Specialist
World Bank/Pakistan

Conducted institutional feasibility study of the Punjab Urban Transport Corporation in Pakistan. Performed financial, organizational and manpower analysis, and designed technical assistance measures for improving

the efficiency of bus operations as well as for resolving problems related to revenue losses, redundant labor, and labor-management relations.

Oct 1986 - Feb 1987 Organizational Development Specialist
USAID/Pakistan

Conducted institutional analysis of the four provincial irrigation departments in Pakistan in terms of their capacity for design and maintenance of the irrigation systems. Analyzed organizational structure, financial and budgetary procedures as well as manpower needs. Developed plans for organizational improvements through staff development and training, restructured budgetary procedures, and

management information system. Conducted an assessment of management training needs for the departments' senior engineers.

**1985 - 1986 Vice President, ICF Consulting Associates Incorporated
Washington, D.C.**

Directed ICF's International Consulting Division and designed programs in regulatory management and policy and economic analysis in energy and environment sectors. Planned and implemented business development strategies; developed funded programs with the USAID, World Bank, and Asian Development Bank; and recruited and supervised staff and consultants.

Jul 1984 - May 1985 Management Specialist, USAID/Egypt

Designed a technical assistance project for capacity building of Sakkara Local Development Training Center. Assessed manpower training needs for key ministries; identified in-country and overseas training institutions and resources; designed core training programs; developed a program for training of trainers and for decentralizing training delivery.

Designed and implemented a training program at the USDA Graduate School for senior Egyptian government officials of the departments of water and sanitation, roads, and local government responsible for implementing the Basic Village Services Project. As lead trainer, conducted six weeks of intensive training sessions in project planning, implementation, and evaluation.

Evaluated USAID's overseas participant training programs for Egyptian government officials associated with the Basic Village Services Project. Identified methods for improving curriculum, selection process, and integration of management and technical training.

**Mar - Apr 1984 Management Specialist, American Academy for the Advancement of
Sciences
Washington, D.C.**

Carried out a diagnostic study, in consultation with senior officials, of organizational and management problems of the Office of the Science and Technology. Designed strategies to improve organizational effectiveness and staff development and assisted senior management in redesigning projects and establishing procedures for project implementation and monitoring.

**Jan - Mar 1984 Management Training Consultant
USDA Graduate School, Washington. D.C.**

Designed and conducted training seminars for senior level U.S. federal government personnel in regulatory management and public policy analysis.

1984 - 1987 **Adjunct Professor, University of District of Columbia
Washington, D.C.**

Designed and taught courses in comparative public administration and development in South and South-East Asia.

1981 - 1983 **Training Advisor, Institute of Administration
Zaria, Nigeria**

Designed and supervised training programs in project planning and implementation for senior government personnel and developed operational measures for institutional improvements of the Institute.

1977 - 1981 **Management Specialist
Battelle Memorial Institute, Washington, D.C.**

Assessed population-development policy and five year plans for the Government of Pakistan. Identified management and institutional as well as socio-cultural problems in implementing the plans with special focus on delivery of services. Developed appropriate measures to overcome implementation problems. Conducted similar activities in Jordan.

Conducted economic, environmental, and social assessment of impact of coal-based energy technologies in the United States under a contract with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.

Designed and implemented a community-based approach for introducing environmental education under a contract with U.S. Department of Education. Developed curricula and trained teachers and school administrators. Designed a strategy for diffusion of the program in school systems.

Designed a community-based planning model to promote solar energy development at state and local levels. Applied the model in four communities in the State of New York and trained local government officials and community leaders in participatory planning, technology assessment, and local resource generation.

1973 - 1977 **Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science
University of Hawaii**

Designed and taught graduate and undergraduate courses in comparative public administration and development with special focus on South and South-East Asia.

1971 - 1973 **Research Fellow, Culture Learning Institute
East- West Center, University of Hawaii**

Conducted cross-cultural research in development administration systems of India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and Nepal.

Conducted field-research on regional development policy issues in Pakistan, as part of Ph.D thesis preparation. Research entailed development of an analytic model to explicate decision-makers' interpretations of issues and events; collection of data on decision makers' cognitive structures; and analysis and simulation of data to map decisional patterns and implications for national integration and regional economic development in Pakistan.

ABSEVALS.SUM

The Technical Assistance Resources II Project (TRP-II) is a follow-on to TRP-I. The overall objective of the Project is to improve BDG's technical and managerial capacity to plan and implement development programs. The Project has supported a number of technical assistance and training activities since its authorization in 1988. A majority of TRP-II sub-projects have focused on BDG's capacity building in food and agriculture sectors. These sub-projects include: Bangladesh Food Policy Project (BFPP), Food Policy Monitoring Unit (FPMU), Human Resource Development in Agriculture (HRD/Winrock), and Institute of Post-Graduate Studies in Agriculture (IPSA). The Evaluation indicates that these sub-projects have contributed to policy reforms and institution building in BDG regardless of the fact that they were carried over from TRP-I and some of the sub-projects were pursued in disregard of TRP-II criteria.

TRP-II, as a Project, has contributed toward policy reforms and institutional development in several sectors, and especially in agriculture and food sectors. TRP-II has also served as a catalyst for institution building and human resource development in agriculture sector, as in the case of IPSA and FPMU. These achievements conform well with the overall objectives of the Project. However, sustainability of policy reforms undertaken by the Government remains at stake without institutional reforms and qualitative development in public administration. Sustainability is also necessary to protect USAID's investments and to consolidate emergent gains. The Evaluation recommends that TRP-II could sharpen the focus of its inputs by re-orienting its resources within the framework of public administration. This proposed reorientation is consistent with current priorities of BDG, USAID, and other donors aimed at improving administrative performance.

The benefits of the short-term training funded under TRP-II appear to be marginal. The Evaluation recommends that USAID and ERD should take appropriate measures to improve selection methods and design of training activities. Additionally, the Evaluation recommends that design of technical assistance and training should be integrated, to the extent possible, in order to better respond to the requirements of administrative efficiency improvements in the Government. The DMT sub-component activities are discretely formulated with no specified links between and among them. TRP-II as a project and the DMT as its component are aimed at improving managerial and technical capacity in the Government and to help build training capacity of local institutions. The integration of DMT sub-component activities within an institutional development framework is necessary. The Evaluation recommends that ERD should take necessary initiative to determine respective roles and responsibilities of ERD, MOE, BPATC and other recipient institutions of DMT funding and provide the needed coordination and approval for an early implementation of the DMT component, as an integrated plan.

AIDEVALS.SUM

1. The Technical Resources II Project (TRP-II) is a follow-on to TRP-I. The Project was authorized in 1988 as an umbrella financing mechanism for funding short-term technical assistance and training in response to priorities of the USAID Mission and BDG. A subsequent amendment to the Project increased its total funding to \$30 million and extended the project completion date to August 1998.
2. TRP-II funded technical assistance activities have produced both direct and indirect benefits to the Bangladesh Government's (BDG's) policy reform program as well as enhanced the Mission's portfolio. BDG's food policy reforms, supported by the Bangladesh Food Policy Project (BFPP) including the institutional development of Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) have been mutually beneficial and responsive to BDG and USAID priorities. For the USAID, TRP-II sub-projects namely BFPP, IPSA, HRD/Winrock have helped to produce cumulative and synergistic effects on food and agriculture program of the Mission's portfolio. Parallel financing under TRP-II has complemented the inputs of other donors by providing technical assistance for capacity building in food and agriculture sectors and improved inter-donor coordination.
3. The capacity building in BDG institutions have been achieved in terms of operational outputs of the sub-projects. This Evaluation, on the basis of the review of the sub-projects, however, indicates that some of the gains have been insufficient to provide sustainable operations due to frequent rotations and loss of trained personnel in the client institutions as well as due to insufficient progress on required policy reforms on the part of BDG. The Evaluation recommends that TRP-II criteria and its activities should explicitly take into account sustainability considerations in project design and monitoring.
4. According to this Evaluation, the focus of the TRP-II sub-activities in technical assistance and training do not appear to be a function of deliberately planned priorities. Four of the nine sub-projects namely IPSA, BFPP, FMPU, HRD/Winrock funded by TRP-II are essentially carry-overs from TRP-I; and three of the sub-projects namely IPSA, Flood Action Plan (FAP), Export Development, parallel financed by TRP-II, are in support of initiatives by other donors. Of the remaining two, Dhaka Stock Exchange (DSE) is a unilateral obligation, and the Public Administration Efficiency Study (PAES), a BDG initiative, the recommendations of which remain to be implemented by the Government. This suggests a lack of a framework for selection and prioritization. It further suggests that TRP-II activities have been largely supply-driven and that the TRP-II resources appear to search for 'fundable' activities, rather than the opposite.
5. The selection of TA sub-projects has been a bit ad-hoc and too diffused which makes it difficult to consolidate the gains of TRP-II investments in improving BDG's technical and managerial capacities. The overall objective of TRP-II being the improvement of BDG's technical and managerial capacity requires technical assistance in support of development of core competencies, quality manpower, and better management practices. Technical assistance directed at discreet sectors under TRP-II is insufficient

to build the overall capacity in the Government. Hence, there is a need to sharpen the focus of TRP-II within a coherent framework. The Evaluation recommends that the Project should adopt public administration as an overall framework for its future operations. In addition, collaborative planning should be undertaken within the following proposed parameters: i) integrated planning of technical assistance and training activities directed to capacity building in BDG; ii) support to build qualitative aspects of training; iii) sustainability considerations in determining future operations; and iv) mutually agreed procedures for defining priorities.

6. The usefulness of TRP-II, in specific, should be viewed in relation to the added value that TRP-II money has provided to selected high priority activities. This Evaluation indicates that such added value is evident, to a great extent, from the technical outputs and benefits of the sub-projects. However, procedural liberties taken both on USAID and BDG sides in the past with respect to the lack of mutual consent, lack of prioritization procedures, diverse focus of selection, and leniencies in project monitoring and closure are indicative of hidden costs. A transparent system to determine mutually agreed priorities combined with improved project design, implementation, monitoring and closure procedures are pre-requisites for a better utilization of TRP-II resources, both in financial and institutional terms.

7. ERD, as the implementing agency for TRP-II Program has substantially improved its coordination and consultative functions both with respect to USAID and BDG line ministries. The staff resources relative to the amount of work in ERD are limited. Both ERD and USAID could certainly benefit from additional staff, preferably with technical qualifications and experience in project design and approval. The Evaluation recommends that ERD and USAID should discuss the issue of understaffing and take corrective actions. In addition, ERD should strengthen its MIS in order to play a more active role in future planning of TRP-II activities.

8. The change in BDG's orientation to selectively utilize foreign technical assistance is likely to decrease the demand for technical assistance and increase the demand for training. In the context of TRP-II, this is likely to happen due to stringent technical requirements related to planning and implementing technical assistance activities as compared to what is required for implementing insufficiently planned and ad-hoc training programs. The change requires improvements in ERD's capacity to manage TRP-II and an integration of TA and training activities, to the maximum possible, directed at institutional development.

9. Regardless of the merits and de-merits of the BDG guidelines, we suggest that ERD take required initiatives to utilize TRP-II resources in a demand-driven manner. For future planning of TRP-II activities, we recommend that once USAID and ERD agree upon an initial project concept that USAID could directly assist the concerned client institution in design of the project and preparation of TAPP. Furthermore, ERD should ensure an expeditious approval of the planned activities.

10. The Evaluation has also examined the effects of TRP-II funded activities on the management of Mission's regular portfolio. The effects of TRP-II on the Mission's portfolio can be summarized as:

- (a) The TRP-II sub-projects were instrumental in producing synergistic effects, especially in agriculture and food sectors.
- (b) TRP-II enhanced sustainability of USAID's investments.
- (c) TRP-II supported other donor initiatives and helped improve inter-donor coordination.
- (d) TRP-II increased labor-intensity in project management on the part of Mission's technical offices.
- (e) TRP-II utilized "less competitive" money for certain low impact activities, especially in training.
- (f) TRP-II adversely affected standard project monitoring procurement procedures.
- (g) TRP-II created significant problems in project closures.

11. TRP-II, as a Project, has contributed toward policy reforms and institutional development in several sectors, and especially in agriculture and food sectors. TRP-II has also served as a catalyst for institution building and human resource development in agriculture sector, as in the case of IPSA and FPMU. These achievements conform well with the overall objectives of the Project. However, sustainability of policy reforms undertaken by the Government remains at stake without institutional reforms and qualitative development in public administration. Sustainability is also necessary to protect USAID's investments and to consolidate emergent gains. The Evaluation recommends that TRP-II could sharpen the focus of its inputs by re-orienting its resources within the framework of public administration. This proposed reorientation is consistent with current priorities of BDG, USAID, and other donors aimed at improving administrative performance.

12. The findings from the Participants' Survey, though tentative, suggest a lack of clear benefits of overseas training in terms of skill development in BDG. The Evaluation recommends that USAID and ERD should take appropriate measures to improve selection methods and design of training programs. Further, USAID should consider utilization of regional training institutions to the maximum possible and in appropriate areas which will help to reduce cost, and improve relevance of training, on account of similarities in learning environments among regional countries. Use of regional training institutions will also help to develop linkages between BPATC and other institutions and facilitate frequent exchange of faculty and other resources at affordable costs.

13. The DMT sub-component activities are discretely formulated with no specified links between and among them. TRP-II as a project and the DMT as its component are aimed at improving managerial and technical capacity in the Government and to help build training capacity of local institutions. The integration of DMT sub-component activities within an institutional development framework is necessary. The Evaluation recommends that ERD should take necessary initiative to determine respective roles and responsibilities of ERD, MOE, BPATC and other recipient institutions of DMT funding and provide the needed coordination and approval for an early implementation of the DMT component, as an integrated plan. BPATC, being the main beneficiary of DMT components, should develop an integrated plan for DMT inputs, for both in-country and overseas training. Involvement of BMDC, APD, IBA, and other training institutions will be necessary in this process. BPATC should also develop an annual

implementation plan based on the integrated plan as suggested or convert the integrated plan into a 3 year sub-project and ERD should ensure quick approval through a PIL.